

IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE UNITED STATES
DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA
CHARLESTON DIVISION

4 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,) 2:15-cr-00472-RMG
5 Plaintiff,)
6 VS)
7 DYLAN STORM ROOF,) Charleston,
8 Defendant.) South Carolina
January 11, 2017

TRANSCRIPT OF SENTENCING HEARING
BEFORE THE HONORABLE RICHARD M. GERGEL,
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiff: JULIUS NESS RICHARDSON
Assistant U.S. Attorney
U.S. Attorneys Office
1441 Main Street, Suite 500
Columbia, South Carolina 29201

MARY J. HAHN
Assistant U.S. Attorney
U.S. Department of Justice
601 D Street NW, Room 5200
Washington, DC 20003

NATHAN STUART WILLIAMS
Assistant U.S. Attorney
U.S. Attorneys Office
P.O. Box 876
Charleston, South Carolina

RICHARD E. BURNS
Assistant U.S. Attorney
U.S. Department of Justice
1331 F Street NW, Suite 625
Washington, DC 20530

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

STEPHEN CURRAN
Assistant U.S. Attorney
U.S. Department of Justice
601 D Street NW, Room 5808
Washington, DC 20004

For the Defendant

SARAH S. GANNETT
Assistant Federal Public Defender
Arizona Federal Public Defenders Office
850 West Adams Street, Suite 201
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

DAVID I. BRUCK, ESQ.
Virginia Capital Case Clearinghouse
Washington and Lee School of Law
Lexington, Virginia 24450

EMILY PAAVOLA, ESQ.
Justice 360
900 Elmwood Avenue, Suite 101
Columbia, South Carolina 29201

KIMBERLY C. STEVENS, ESQ.
1070-1 Tunnel Road, Suite 10-215
Asheville, North Carolina 28805

* * *

Court Reporter:

Amy C. Diaz, RPR, CRR
P.O. Box 835
Charleston, South Carolina 29402

Proceedings recorded by mechanical shorthand,
transcript produced by computer-aided transcription

THE CLERK: Place your left hand on the Bible, raise your right, state your full name for the record, please.

(Thereupon, the sign language interpreters were first duly sworn.)

THE COURT: First of all, I had the opportunity to speak to our very conscientious jurors last evening, and they asked to attend the sentencing hearing today, so if you could bring in the jury.

(Thereupon, the jury returned to the courtroom.)

THE COURT: Please be seated. Let me begin by asking Mr. Roof, do you desire to have counsel assist you in the sentencing hearing today?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: You are asking me to appoint them to assist you in the sentencing hearing today; is that correct?

THE DEFENDANT: That's correct.

THE COURT: Very good. I grant that motion, and Mr. Bruck, Ms. Stevens, you are now appointed to represent the defendant in this proceeding here today.

MS. STEVENS: Thank you, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Yes. I have -- the first matter that I have, I received a motion this morning to bifurcate and delay a portion of the sentencing proceeding so that a presentence report can be prepared. Let me explain a little bit about

1 what a presentence report is. In a normal criminal case, I
2 would say probably 95 percent of my cases are guilty pleas
3 and I know nothing about the defendant. We do a presentence
4 report to provide me a background. And in -- and in cases
5 which I try, there is not uncommonly some evidence about
6 background that I would not normally have access to during
7 the criminal trial, and the presentence report has some
8 background. Under the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure,
9 it is recognized there is an exception for the provision of
10 presentence reports in capital cases, and that is because the
11 thought is that the sentencing phase of the proceeding is the
12 equivalent at a minimum of what I would get in a presentence
13 report, and the rule explicitly provides no requirement for a
14 presentence report.

15 Having presided over this matter, including multiple
16 evidentiary hearings, competency hearings, a guilt phase
17 trial, and a sentencing phase proceeding, I have absolutely
18 no need for a presentence report. I have vastly more
19 information than I would ever receive in a presentence
20 report. I did, just for my own knowledge, did look at, if
21 there had not been a capital case, the Guidelines, and first
22 degree murder, the Guideline is life, use of a firearm --
23 offense level 43, and that is the complete top of the chart.
24 It would be enhanced, many enhancements on top of that. One
25 being the use of a firearm would be an additional four, and

1 literally the offense of -- the offense level would be off
2 the chart. That is above life.

3 I don't feel a need -- I did that just to inform
4 myself, but I have no need for a presentence report, so I
5 deny the motion for a presentence report and the delay in the
6 sentencing proceeding.

7 The defendant also asked for the right to be heard,
8 and I will absolutely give him that right. I had intended to
9 give him that right. I think that is a right of everyone
10 before sentencing. They should be heard.

11 And Mr. Bruck and Ms. Stevens, I'll be glad to hear
12 from you and anyone who wishes to speak on the defendant's
13 behalf. That is part of this proceeding.

14 So let me talk a little bit about the proceeding. I
15 will first hear from the Government, and through the
16 Government, from any victims who wish to be heard. And I'm
17 going to let the Government determine who they may wish to
18 bring forward, and I will sit here as long as I need to sit
19 here.

20 MR. RICHARDSON: Thank you, Your Honor.

21 THE COURT: Yes. I will next hear from the
22 defendant and his counsel and anyone who wishes to speak on
23 behalf of the defendant. I will then pronounce the sentence
24 to be imposed. I will follow that with some legal matters I
25 need to address after that, which I will do. Okay?

Mr. Richardson, the Government.

MR. RICHARDSON: Thank you, Your Honor. We'll start with Ms. Paula Sheppard -- excuse me, Your Honor. I apologize. We are going to start with Tywanza Sanders' family, and we'll start with Ms. Sanders.

THE COURT: I'm glad to hear from her.

Ms. Sanders, you hardly need an introduction with me, but for the record, could you please state your name.

MS. SANDERS: I'm Felicia Sanders.

THE COURT: Proceed.

MS. SANDERS: Good morning.

Dylann Storm Roof, I call you Dylann Storm Roof because you deserve it. You deserve respect, the respect that you did not give Aunt Susie, Reverend Clementa Pinckney. You didn't give respect to Reverend Sharonda Singleton. No respect for Reverend Daniel Simmons. No respect for Ethel Lance. No respect for Tywanza, my baby, Sanders. You gave no one respect. No respect for DePayne Middleton. No respect for Cynthia Hurd. No respect at all. But I'm going to give you respect.

You took my loved ones away from me, and since June 17th, I have gotten to know you. Yes, I know you. I know you because you are in my head. You are in my head every day all day. You made me develop a lot of I can'ts: I can't hear balloons pop. I can't see the fireworks. I can't

1 hear something as small as an acorn drop from out of a tree.
2 And most -- most importantly, I cannot shut my eyes to pray.
3 I cannot shut my eyes to pray. Even when I try, I cannot
4 because I have to keep my eye on everyone that is around me.

5 That's a sad day when someone will walk in a church
6 and kill innocent people. That's very sad. I brought my
7 Bible to the courtroom with me. My Bible is all bad,
8 bruised, torn up, shot at. When I look at my Bible, it
9 reminds me the blood that Jesus shed for me, and you, Dylann
10 Roof. The blood that Jesus shed for me way back on Calvary.
11 It will never lose its power. So when I think of you, I just
12 see somebody cold who is lost, who the devil has come back to
13 reclaim.

14 I don't know what to say. I don't know what to do
15 from here out. I have to get myself back together. I have a
16 child that I worry about every single day of her life. Every
17 day I have to worry about her. That's not fair. That's not
18 fair to her. That's not fair to anyone.

19 This is my Bible. It's all bruised. It's all
20 blood-stained and blood-stained through and through. I
21 cherish this Bible. They say they don't want me to have it,
22 but I wanted my Bible. I wanted my Bible. Even though they
23 washed every page -- I don't know how they did it -- but when
24 I look at it, the words still remain the same. I still have
25 every word, every single word in this Bible, even those

1 || washed.

2 I feel sad for you. Yes, I forgive you. That was
3 the easiest thing I had to do. That was the easiest thing.
4 But you can't help someone who don't want to help themself,
5 and that is you. I don't have much else to say to you, but
6 I'm going to end with this: May God have mercy on your soul.

7 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Shirrene Goss.

8 THE COURT: Yes.

9 MS. GOSS: Good morning.

10 THE COURT: Good morning.

11 MS. GOSS: I am Shirrene Goss, sister of Tywanza
12 Sanders, grandniece of Susie Jackson.

13 You don't like to be called evil, I see. But young
14 man, you are among the worst kind of evil. Your actions have
15 disrupted countless lives and caused tremendous pain. You
16 have said you didn't have to do this, but you felt like you
17 had to do this. The fact is you did not have to do this,
18 just as my brother Tywanza urged you not to. You did all of
19 this and for what? You didn't start a race war. You didn't
20 rid the world of all black people or any of the other groups
21 you have spoken so negatively about. You didn't accomplish
22 anything but a deep hurt for a lot of people.

1 earth. And let us not forget the survivors who are all near
2 and dear to me, and you've hurt them, so you've hurt me.

3 One day before your final earthly judgment, it's
4 going to come to you, and you are going to realize that you
5 did not have to do this. And it's going to hit you hard.
6 It's going to bring you to your knees, and then you are going
7 to have to ask -- no, you are going to have to beg for
8 forgiveness.

9 And I just simply want to say again that my brother
10 didn't deserve what he got. None of the victims did. But
11 you deserve every bit of the sentence that you received. And
12 just -- we are not broken. We are hurt, yes, but we are not
13 broken. That's all.

14 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Goss.

15 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Tyrone Sanders.

16 THE COURT: Yes. Mr. Sanders.

17 MR. SANDERS: Good morning.

18 I need you to look at me. A snowflake, a snowflake
19 is a precipitations from the clouds. Each crystal of snow is
20 very different. Thinking about a human, whether it comes
21 from biblical or the creation of man, when man was created or
22 evolved, it was in one place on this earth, longitude or
23 latitude. Men multiply. They move throughout the earth.
24 Some gain, some lost some.

25 You look at each individual in this room, it's

1 almost like a snowflake. Each and every one of us are a
2 little different. None of us look alike. But we are still
3 human. I don't know where you got your education from, so
4 they say you got it from the Internet with your race hatred,
5 but we all started from one or two individuals. What I want
6 you to do is close your eyes, since you don't look at me, and
7 think, before you meet your fate, that somebody in your
8 family might meet with somebody from Zimbabwe and produce a
9 child -- a black man from Zimbabwe. And I want you to look
10 to your right, look to your left. The man who is guarding
11 you is a little darker, but he's human.

12 Why you want to single out black people in a church
13 like that, I don't know. But whoever the Creator is needs to
14 come and deal with you. And I hope if you go up to an appeal
15 and this goes through you or anybody acts like you did, I
16 wish they could enact another law to cut a limb each time you
17 are to appeal. And if you get all four of them cut off,
18 instead of taxpayers paying the dollar for you, let your
19 parents take care of you.

20 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am, give me your name, please.

21 MS. M. WASHINGTON: Good morning, Mabel Terry
22 Washington.

23 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am.

24 MS. M. WASHINGTON: I am Tywanza's aunt. But if --
25 I came to talk about Tywanza, but I want to talk about Aunt

1 Susie. Aunt Susie is really not my aunt; however, when
2 Tyrone and Felicia got married, we told Tyrone, "You didn't
3 marry just Felicia. You married the whole family." So
4 whenever there was a function or something at the house or
5 whatever, Aunt Susie would be there. So we adopted her as
6 our aunt.

7 THE COURT: She adopted you, right?

8 MS. M. WASHINGTON: We adopted -- we adopted each
9 other, but there is so many things I could say about her
10 besides her being a quiet, gentle person. The thing that I'm
11 going to miss the most about her is that whenever we have a
12 family gathering over at Tyrone's and Felicia's house, she
13 would be there, and as the night go on and we are having a
14 lot of laughter, we would convince them, number one, to sing
15 a song, and Aunt Susie and Aunt Eve would sing us a song, and
16 then we would convince them to dance. And that is one of the
17 things that I will miss the most is her holding and the cane
18 and dancing for us as we egged her to keep on going.

19 Now, going to Tywanza. Tywanza's my nephew. My
20 sister and I were talking yesterday, and she was saying how
21 Tywanza made her feel special, that she was a special aunt.
22 Well, at a function we had, she said, "I know Tywanza love
23 me, and I know that I'm his special aunt."

24 So I kind of look at her, "Really?"

25 THE COURT: That's not what he told you, right?

1 MS. M. WASHINGTON: Right. So we all were special
2 to him in one way or the other. He loved each of us
3 individually in his own way. Whenever Tywanza was home, you
4 can always tell what he want by the greeting that you get.
5 If he say, "Hi, big mama," or "Hi, auntie," I know Tywanza
6 wants something. If he said, "Hey, calling to see how you
7 are doing," we are going to have a good conversation. Okay.

8 But even though this has affected us as a family,
9 the thing that affects me the most is the cousins. And our
10 children grew up all together. There are seven girls in the
11 family on Felicia's side -- on her side of the family. There
12 is seven girls and two boys. Our parents died when we were
13 young, so we always had each other. So our children grew up
14 in each other's house. Whenever Tyrone would have to
15 discipline one, he would discipline them all. So the same
16 upbringing that Tywanza got, our kids got as well.

17 The cousins have took it extremely hard missing
18 Tywanza. They miss his phone calls. They miss coming home
19 and not having him there. But even though the cousins are
20 affected, the most affected are the younger ones, the
21 great -- the grands, his grand cousins, the little ones.
22 When you have an eight-year-old coming home from school and
23 asking you, "Mommy, why did that guy kill Tywanza?" it's
24 difficult for you to answer them.

25 You've got a six-year-old talking on the phone, and

1 you say, "Who are you talking to?" She said, "I'm talking to
2 Tywanza." Or she come to you and say, "Mommy, please take me
3 to Tywanza's grave. I want to talk to him." Those things
4 hurt. Those things are the things that are difficult for us
5 to answer, the questions, because some of the answers, we
6 don't even know ourself.

7 So I wanted to say to Dylann that you not only
8 affected the people that was in the church that night, but
9 you affected the family and affected the world. You didn't
10 destroy anything. You brought us all together. I went to
11 work after this incident occurred. I didn't want to work
12 anymore. I didn't want to come out the house. I had worked
13 in the medical field for 39 years. I have met people of all
14 different diversity, some of my friends, some of my
15 associates. One of my friends said to me, she said, "I am
16 disgusted. I feel sick being a white person for what has
17 been done to you all."

18 But I would go to work. Everybody would walk around
19 like they are walking on eggshells, and one day I had to
20 bring myself together and say, "Listen, we are not going to
21 have this anymore. Turn the radio up because we are going to
22 have a good time in here. We are not going to let him
23 destroy us, and it's not going to happen." It hasn't
24 happened, and it won't happen.

25 And the people that you did take away, I know that

1 they would tell you, "Son, before you leave this earth, you
2 had better repent," and that is what I'm going to leave you
3 with today. And I will -- someday within your heart -- I
4 hope you've got a heart in there -- someday you will repent,
5 and that's all I've got to say.

6 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Washington.

7 State your name.

8 MS. BROWN: Good morning. My name is Eartha Joyce
9 Terry Brown. I really don't want to look over there at him
10 because I know how I get when I get really upset.

11 THE COURT: You look over here at me, then.

12 MS. BROWN: I would rather look at you. At least
13 you are smiling, and we carry that smile all the time. My
14 favorite thing I always say is the joy that I have. The
15 world didn't give it, and the world is not going to take it
16 away. So I continue to smile on.

17 What I want to say is I love my family. I love my
18 family from the bottom of my heart, and when they hurt, I
19 hurt. And I have a habit of holding back my feelings so they
20 wouldn't get upset. And to see my sister the way she's been,
21 it really tore me apart. And she keeps telling me, "Eartha,
22 settle down, settle down, settle down." But it's hard for me
23 to settle down because I want to see her smile. I want to
24 see my brother-in-law, my niece, my family smile. And it's
25 hard to do.

1 They tell us we can say and stand here as long as we
2 could, but if I was to stand up here all -- and tell you how
3 I really feel, we would be here all day, and I know y'all
4 want to go home.

5 I just want to say it really hurts. It really
6 hurts. I was a faithful, faithful member at Mother Emanuel
7 AME Church. At that church we were a family there. Me and
8 my sisters, we work hard in that church. We had our kids;
9 they worked hard in that church. Now for me, I can't even go
10 downstairs in that basement. I can't go downstairs in that
11 basement. And especially after really seeing the pictures
12 and stuff, I can't do it. I can't walk over memories of nine
13 of the most incredible, beautiful people you have ever met.

14 I remember when I first met Reverend Simmons. I was
15 working at a man's clothing store, and he came in there, and
16 I didn't know who he was, but he knew the ladies I worked
17 with in the back. And the jokes he was making and stuff, you
18 know, I just say, "Well, he's a preacher?"

19 The next thing I know, I went to church two Sundays
20 after that. He was sitting there in our Sunday school, and
21 they said, "Oh, he's our new preacher now."

22 And I tell my sister, I said, "Reverend Simmons is
23 going to be our preacher now?" And I couldn't wait to get
24 back to work to let them know that he was at our church. But
25 he was really, really, really awesome. Awesome. Everyone

1 was just so awesome. I just can't go downstairs no more.

2 We sit in church to try to hear the word, and you've
3 got all these people coming in. You are not comfortable
4 anymore. You've got your grandkids who you have in the
5 church participating, trying to teach them the right way to
6 love, and they don't even want to go downstairs no more
7 because they don't want to run over Tywanza. They don't want
8 to run over Ms. Susie. They don't want to sit and see where
9 the other people who they love and talk to them so -- and try
10 to encourage them so much. They was killed. It's really --
11 it's sad. It's sad.

12 And he talk about hate. You talk about hate, but we
13 teach -- I learned from a very early age that you don't hate
14 the person, you hate what they do. And if you don't like
15 what they do, you try to talk to them. You try to get them
16 help, but you don't destroy their life. And it's just so
17 sad. It's just -- and I know we standing here. We are
18 talking -- we are talking, but everybody else is listening,
19 but this dude is not listening to a thing we are saying.
20 He's not listening to a thing we are saying, but you gave us
21 the honor to get it off our chest, and I thank you for that.

22 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am. It's the least we can do.

23 Could you state your name, please.

24 MS. SCOTT: Janet Terry Scott. Good morning. I am
25 Tywanza's favorite aunt.

THE COURT: You had that firsthand.

MS. SCOTT: I am the one who I know for a fact he loved, L-O-V-E, love. As it was stated earlier by my sister Felicia, her pregnancy was complicated. But she chose to go full force the entire nine months to carry Tywanza. So from day one when Tywanza was born, everything around me became Wanza, Wanza. Wanza was everyone's child. Everybody who knew Tywanza loved Tywanza. Everyone that Tywanza knew as he got older, Wanza showed them special love.

Dylann, Dylann, I know you can hear me. If you had given Tywanza a chance -- even as he knelt there and asked you, "Why are you doing this?" he was still showing you love. He just wanted you to take that one last chance to see how much love was in that room. But you chose not to. Instead of giving him love, you gave him another bullet. You took my loved one away from me.

Your Honor, I didn't have any boys; I had two girls. Tywanza was like their big brother, and as Shirrene said, as he got older and taller, he became more of my husband. My husband died some 30-something years ago. When my daughter got married, Tywanza spoke with at that time future son-in-law. He had a little talk, and I guess everything was fine. They got married 10 years -- 11 years now.

I started writing something down but I chose not to because every time I think to write something down, I had to

1 scratch it out, and I just wanted to get up here and speak
2 from my heart, the heart that you tried to destroy.

3 When I go to my sister's house every Sunday, the
4 last thing my nephew would say to me is, "I love you. Be
5 careful," and the same thing I would say to him, "I love you.
6 Be careful out there." I can't hear his voice say that to me
7 anymore, but guess what? I still have that memory. I still
8 have his memory of him saying to me, "I love you." And it
9 hurts. Physically I can't hear him, but I knew my nephew
10 love me. Tywanza chose to live, to love, and to laugh. And
11 that is something he wanted to share with the world: live,
12 love and laugh.

13 One thing that wasn't mentioned was the fact that
14 Tywanza was an organ donor. Those organs were not able to be
15 distributed to people, his eyes, his kidney, and most of all,
16 his heart. So not only did you destroy the love that Tywanza
17 had and what he wanted to do was to share with the world, you
18 have taken away what it may be when he passed away at a later
19 age. Someone could have had his eyes, his kidney, or that
20 great big heart.

21 I wish you would look at me, boy, but I know you
22 hear me. May the Lord have mercy on you.

23 Thank you.

24 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, for Clementa Pinckney,
25 this is his brother, Kenya.

1 THE COURT: Good. Thank you.

2 MR. RICHARDSON: And his sister.

3 THE COURT: Could you state your name for the
4 record, please, ma'am.

5 MS. MARTINEZ: Janet Pinckney Martinez.

6 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am.

7 MR. PINCKNEY: My name is Kenya Pinckney.

8 THE COURT: Yes, sir.

9 MR. PINCKNEY: The brother of Reverend Senator
10 Clementa Pinckney, the uncle of Eliana and Malana Pinckney,
11 the brother-in-law of Jennifer Pinckney. And on behalf of
12 the Pinckney family, I would like to -- or we would like to
13 thank the courts on its swift and just sentence. Thank the
14 lawyers, the prosecutors, just everyone who had anything and
15 everything to do with the case.

16 I currently live in Germany, served in the military
17 for 23 years --

18 THE COURT: Thank you for your service.

19 MR. PINCKNEY: -- and my whole time in the military,
20 it's all about peace. It's all about justice, and I
21 definitely -- we definitely, my family, would like to thank
22 the courts for everything that they have done for us. And I
23 would like to thank the family members who stepped in during
24 my absence who just helped with my sister-in-law and her kids
25 during this terrible loss in their life. It's a terrible

1 loss to all of us, but I think it has probably impacted no
2 one like my nieces and my sister-in-law.

3 And, Your Honor, that's all I really wanted to say
4 on behalf of the Pinckney family. We just thank the State of
5 South Carolina, the courts for all that you have done.

6 THE COURT: I presume that one of those people would
7 be your sister in terms of stepping up.

8 MR. PINCKNEY: The whole family, from Senator
9 Malloy, from Milland, there is so many people, just too many
10 to name, and just, again, just thank you.

11 MR. RICHARDSON: On behalf of Reverend Dan
12 Simmons Sr., this is Ann Simmons.

13 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am.

14 MS. ANN SIMMONS: Good morning, Judge. My name is
15 Annie Graham Simmons, and I'm the former wife of the Reverend
16 Daniel Simmons Sr.

17 I would like to begin by for the last 19 months what
18 has kept me going and kept my strength going was two words,
19 and, Mr. Roof, I would suggest these two words to you. If
20 you have not experienced them, there are two words, each one
21 of the words has three letters. They are small words, but
22 they have a magnificent impact, and those two words are "but
23 God." But is b-u-t; God is capital G-o-d. The book was
24 written by Herbert Cooper. It has been an inspiration to me
25 to keep me alive, to keep me going, and to help me to

1 maintain my strength day by day.

2 19 months ago, one of the most devastating news that
3 I could receive, even though at the time, Reverend Simmons
4 and I did not live in the same household, but we still were
5 family to two children and four grandchildren, and one of the
6 worst things that I had to do was to receive the news that he
7 had just passed away three hours ago. The first thing
8 entered in my mind, "I am left as a single parent to care and
9 support and oversee two children and four grandchildren."

10 That was a loss.

11 And in the book that I just quoted to you, *But God,*
12 sometimes in our life journey we lose our way, but yet God
13 finds us. And sometimes we lose our strength, but God still
14 heals us. So this morning I will speak directly to you. I'm
15 not certain if you understand either one of those statements,
16 but I recommend strongly to you, and I pray one of the first
17 things that -- not only the Simmons family, but the nine
18 families that was represented from this tragedy, horrific
19 tragedy -- was forgiveness. What does God require of us, but
20 to be to love and do justice?

21 So I am satisfied this morning. I am satisfied what
22 you tried to create here on this earth, hate, it did not
23 resonate in the minds of the nine. These were the chosen
24 sacrificial lambs. They made it in. They were received with
25 a welcome by the Holy Spirit. What you meant is evil. The

1 Holy Spirit interceded and disappointed you and your
2 comments, and God blessed them and welcomed them home.

3 And I thank you, Judge. Thank you so much.

4 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am.

5 MR. RICHARDSON: Alana Simmons, Reverend Dan
6 Simmons' granddaughter.

7 THE COURT: Good morning.

8 MS. ALANA SIMMONS: Good morning.

9 So almost a year and a half ago at the bond hearing,
10 if you remember, I told you that although my grandfather died
11 at the hands of hate, he lived and loved, and he preached
12 love and his legacy would be love, and so hate wouldn't win.
13 And since then I have been working tirelessly in the
14 community, in my family, and everywhere else that I go to
15 convey that same message, that hate doesn't win. Love
16 conquers all.

17 And your choices brought us here. Your -- you
18 talked about having to do this, and then you talked about
19 choosing to do this, and, yes, your choices have brought us
20 here. But our choices, the choices of my family, the choices
21 of the other families represented here, and the choices of
22 the community and the society to respond in love have kept us
23 here.

24 And the thing that I'll miss the most about my
25 grandfather is his strength. My grandfather, and really the

1 whole Simmons side of the family, are just really strong
2 people. Not just physically, but mentally, emotionally, and
3 they are very determined people. But my grandfather's
4 strength, even in his passing, has not only kept our family
5 together, but it's brought his church together. It's bringing
6 the community of people together. And people will live on to
7 honor his life and honor the life of the other victims who
8 are lost.

9 And I wanted you to know -- or I pray that God opens
10 your ears to hear this, but I really wanted you to know that
11 regardless of what you do, what you say, what you think, and
12 what you write, you don't have the power to control anything
13 on this side of the courtroom. We are all moving on in love,
14 and we are moving on in strength, and nothing that you can do
15 will ever be able to stop that.

16 I don't think you chose Emanuel. I don't think that
17 you chose the nine people there. I don't even know if you
18 chose to really do what you did. I think God chose the nine
19 people there. I think God chose Mother Emanuel because he
20 allowed this to happen to elevate the message of love and
21 bringing our communities together. Regardless of what kind
22 of message you thought you were sending, I wanted you to know
23 that the message was not received, and exactly the opposite
24 is happening, and the opposite will continue to happen.

25 My grandfather was a strong man. I believe that is

1 why he made it out of the church that day. But I believe
2 that my grandfather also chose to leave this earth so that he
3 can go to his heavenly home and so that we can continue his
4 legacy and honor him in strength and in endurance.

5 Thank you.

6 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am.

7 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Reverend Simmons'
8 daughter, Rose Simmons.

9 THE COURT: Good morning.

10 MS. ROSE SIMMONS: Good morning, Judge. Thank you
11 for this opportunity.

12 I want to speak to the defendant, Dylann Roof, but
13 most of all, I want to address the hate that he so
14 desperately clings to within his heart. And on this
15 beautiful morning as we are here remembering this tragedy --
16 birthed in his heart, in the heart of a confessed killer of
17 nine innocent, beautiful people. I have never -- nor am I
18 surprised -- have I looked for remorse or accountability, or
19 even sorrow from your heart because at this present time, I
20 know that it's not there.

21 I loved my father. He -- I was just like him. And
22 I'm going to miss him, and I will miss getting to know him
23 all over again in my adult life. But I don't grieve so much
24 for my father because I know he and his eight precious,
25 eternal comrades, they are at this very moment experiencing

1 the greatest peace, and that is a peace not found here on
2 this earth. But in knowing that, I have peace, and it keeps
3 me steady in my walk.

4 However, and surprisingly, Mr. Roof, I grieve for
5 you because a heart that refuses to recognize and yield to
6 this awesome power of love and forgiveness that this nation,
7 combined with many nationalities of people and even these
8 nine beautiful families have shown you throughout this
9 tragedy. I know that that is a heart that is lost to the
10 powers of its very own hell created in itself. My father,
11 Reverend Daniel Lee Simmons Sr., in his last and final
12 earthly act, he extended to you a hand of friendship, love,
13 and acceptability for who you were. And that was, I believe,
14 a soul in need of Jesus.

15 So in my final act of this trial, I want to extend
16 to you a hand of love, following my father's lead and his
17 eight beautiful eternal comrades, and extend to you and bleed
18 the blood of Jesus over your heart, your mind, and your soul.
19 And I pray that one day when you meet Jesus Christ, our Lord
20 and our Savior, he will also extend to you his hand of love.

21 Thank you, Judge.

22 THE COURT: Thank you.

23 MR. RICHARDSON: Dan Simmons Jr.

24 THE COURT: Good morning.

25 MR. SIMMONS: Good morning.

1 Dylann Storm Roof, you heard the plea from the
2 family members for you to look at us. But I understand why
3 you don't want to look at us, so I'm going to speak to the
4 spirit that possesses you, and as you heard my sister say, in
5 my father's last plea, you were welcomed at a Bible study.
6 What you thought would take place was a total opposite. Look
7 at this nation, look at this country, look at these people,
8 everyone expressing love. Given your opportunity, feel the
9 presence and the warmth. Feel it. Feel the spirit. Feel
10 the awesome power of the Holy Spirit. It flows like a river
11 that runs with the blood of Jesus Christ. Feel that awesome
12 power of God. Feel it. Feel it. Feel it. Feel it. Feel
13 the spirit of God.

14 Yes, I'm talking to that spirit that's inside of
15 you. Feel it. It flows. Nothing but life, nothing but the
16 presence, the awesome power of God. Look at the love that
17 this nation, this city, the holy city has poured out. You
18 don't have to look at me, but I see that spirit. I want you
19 to think about that as I forgive you for your act, for your
20 actions. You are just a body being used, did not understand
21 what -- the presence of the evil that possesses you.

22 But thank God if he gives us an opportunity to ask
23 for forgiveness. Forgiveness is the heartbeat, it is the
24 heartbeat that pulls us to another level. I forgive you.
25 Forgiveness is a commandment of God for us. It is an action

1 that we take in order to move on, to feel better, and when we
2 insert it, it makes us feel good. I know that you don't
3 understand that, but God requires me to forgive you. I
4 forgive you.

5 He also requires me to pray for you, and I do that.
6 I have been doing that since this tragedy. And I want you to
7 understand this: Understand that as you have been judged,
8 know that you have an opportunity to ask for forgiveness.
9 Know that God will forgive you. Know that you can change
10 your life. Oh, I see you turn your head now because I'm
11 speaking to that spirit that's in you. Stay focused. I
12 guarantee you if you choose to serve Him, you will have a
13 better life.

14 Yeah, I hear you breathing all the way over here.
15 Speak to that spirit that's inside you. Colossians 3:13
16 says, "Bear with each other and forgive each other for
17 whatever grievance you have for one another. Forgive us as
18 the Lord forgive you."

19 THE COURT: Thank you, Mr. Simmons.

20 I'm sorry?

21 MS. HAHN: For Sharonda Singleton.

22 THE COURT: Very good.

23 If you could state your name, please, ma'am.

24 MS. HARGROVE: My name is Brenda Hargrove. I'm the
25 aunt of Sharonda Coleman-Singleton whom I have known from the

1 time she was a baby, a child. Her mother, my sister Wanda,
2 and I were close as sisters, just like this; and as such,
3 Wanda's two daughters and my two children were close. We
4 often traveled together. Wherever Wanda went, I also went.
5 Wherever her children were, my children were also. I recall
6 one time I went apartment hunting, and the landlord said to
7 me, "Are these all your children?"

8 And I said, "Well, no. I have two." But by the
9 same token, my sister Wanda at times had four children with
10 her. I baby-sit for her -- I would baby-sit for her. My
11 sister would baby-sit for me. My children stayed overnight
12 at Wanda's. Her children stayed overnight with me.

13 Sharonda has always been a sweet, sweet, sweet
14 person with a sweet, sweet spirit. Her sister Shalisa said
15 to me last year, "Aunt Brenda, do you remember when Tookey
16 joined the church?"

17 And I said, "No. Refresh my memory."

18 She said, "Well, Tookey got up one Sunday and she
19 walked toward the front. I got up. I went behind her. My
20 daughter got up and went behind her." The three of them
21 joined the church at that time back in 1979, and Sharonda was
22 a mere nine years old. She has always been serious about her
23 faith. She served in the church as a nurse attendant to the
24 care of the pastor.

25 We continue to spend much time together, and when

1 she completed her college education, as she moved to the
2 Atlanta area, I would come down to visit Sharonda. Sharonda
3 would come up to New Jersey to visit me. My son, when he
4 moved to the Atlanta area, he lived with Sharonda until he
5 was able to find a place of his own. Sharonda stayed with
6 me, and she would stay with her sister Jackie as well. That
7 will not be happening anymore.

8 My city is Newark, New Jersey. My mayor of the City
9 of Newark, New Jersey, put on a memorial service for Sharonda
10 at the church that I attend. He called one of the local
11 pastors. Pastor got in touch with me, and we coordinated the
12 program for her at that time. They made some large posters,
13 and one of the posters continued to hang in the vestibule of
14 the church that I attend, the church that she was baptized
15 in.

16 When we were at the house, Sharonda and I both love
17 coffee, and we would have our coffee, and we would talk, and
18 we would reminisce about different things. Sharonda, just
19 the sweetest person -- she was so sweet. I am truly going to
20 miss her. At this event I mentioned at my church, everyone
21 expected me to speak, and I said I cannot formulate a
22 sentence. I was just so heartbroken with her passing. And I
23 asked the Lord right now this morning today to give me the
24 strength in this last opportunity to just say what a great
25 person that she was. Whatever Sharonda did, she put her

1 heart in it. She put her soul in it. She did her studying
2 for her ministry, and Sharonda had completed her coursework
3 to earn her Ph.D. in speech pathology, so she was very
4 diligent with her work.

5 On the night of June 17th -- I remember it very
6 vividly -- Shalisa called me from Atlanta, incoherent,
7 crying, telling me that Sharonda was shot, and I just
8 couldn't comprehend. I couldn't understand what she was
9 saying. "Where is she?" I said.

10 She said, "In the church."

11 I said, "Church?"

12 And she said, "Yes," but she -- she couldn't talk,
13 so her daughter Talayka took the phone and said, "Aunt
14 Brenda, I got her. I'm going to drive," and they were told
15 to come here to Charleston.

16 And I said, "Please call me the moment you arrive in
17 Charleston," and she assured me that they would.

18 So I called a person that I knew in New Jersey and
19 asked them -- told them what had happened, and she said,
20 "Well, I have an aunt down in South Carolina. I'll call
21 her." And she said, "Well, yeah, something is on the news
22 about a church shooting." So I stayed up all night watching
23 CNN. I couldn't sleep anyway.

24 I do some searches on Facebook from time to time,
25 and many of the family members and some friends are using her

1 picture as a profile picture. When I see her picture, it
2 still saddens me. It grieves me as something that was so
3 needless, and I thought something that should not have
4 happened. I know and understand that she has three children
5 agonizing in grief at her loss. And the reason that I
6 thought that I was unable to speak is that being the
7 matriarch now at this time of the family that I would be
8 unable to hold it together, and I always considered the three
9 small children. But I hope and pray, and I believe that God
10 is going to give Cameron, Kayla, Chris, Lisa, Jackie, and
11 Tony the strength that they need to continue.

12 Thank you much.

13 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am.

14 MS. HAHN: For DePayne Middleton Doctor.

15 THE COURT: Could you state your name, please,
16 ma'am.

17 MS. B. BROWN: My name is Bethane Middleton Brown,
18 and I am the baby sister of reverend DePayne Middleton. I
19 have written something, but before I start, I just wanted to
20 share that my sister was a borrowed angel, and that we are
21 still the family, or a family that love built. And I guess,
22 I don't believe in luck, but grateful for you. I'm a part of
23 a family that love built. I wanted to hate you. God, I
24 wanted to hate you. But my faith tells me no. I wanted to
25 remain angry and bitter, but my beautiful life won't let me.

1 I tried to find the worst name that I could call you,
2 including Lucifer, but I could not find any worth in your
3 life to support the claim.

4 I wanted to question God about how could he allow
5 this tragedy to happen? He was supposed to be our provider
6 and protector. God waited until I was least expecting, and
7 he said, "I protect the soul, not the flesh." So in his
8 words, I had to accept the words of ashes to ashes and dust
9 to dust.

10 I wanted to tell you that you took someone precious
11 from me, but my belief says she was a borrowed angel that God
12 called home. You didn't touch her; you didn't touch her
13 soul. You didn't take anything. So I say to you, you put
14 forth all of that effort, and you got nothing in return that
15 you wanted. You didn't touch her soul, and the memories are
16 so deep it exemplifies her spirit easily. Yes, you thought
17 you killed her. But she is still very much alive.
18 Unfortunately for you, because of your ungrateful deeds and
19 because they are so deeply embedded in the seam of your soul,
20 the blueprint of your life, the foundation of your heart,
21 hate has found a lodging place.

22 You have toyed with God's finest angels, and God
23 doesn't take your actions lightly. You seek a life sentence,
24 or asked for it to avoid a death because you are unwilling to
25 yield to repentance and remorse. I have not to this day been

1 able to find a name low enough to warrant your self's worth,
2 so I have ended my efforts to try. Again, I think it's
3 because I am a part of a family that love built; and, again,
4 we have no room for hate. But I believe God called my sister
5 and all the other angels present that night home for their
6 work was done. Welcoming you into their place of worship and
7 Bible study was their way of cleansing themselves. They were
8 without a spot or wrinkle out of that time they were called
9 home. They left behind the old body of ashes and dust and
10 put on their wings of mercy. They flew away like doves in a
11 pleasant sky with an array of sunshine.

12 They left you behind still on this earth slowly
13 dying and withering away. God had given you to Satan, but
14 unlike his angels, he made your soul Satan's playground and
15 will forever allow you to perish until you seek him for
16 yourself. To God be the glory, because there is nothing you
17 can do to harm me or to help yourself except repentance.
18 There is a song that says you can't hide, and you don't know
19 why. God has got your number, and he knows where you live.
20 Death, God will warrant for you.

21 Having said that, I will tell you once again that no
22 weapons, none formed against us, shall prosper. One last
23 thought, Dylann Roof, you can't look at me, but when you are
24 alone, you will hear my voice. You will see my face because
25 you will see my sister. And what you will hear is the same

1 thing. I am a black woman. I am proud. I have an
2 education, just like your family. And just like you wanted
3 to protect yours, I will pray -- I will pray hard to protect
4 mine. You see, you can't have my joy. It's simply not yours
5 to take. You can't have it. So I guess you will spend the
6 rest of your time being angry because you can't have it.

7 The other thing that you will be angry about is
8 because you didn't win. Guess what? You couldn't make me
9 hate you. That's true. You couldn't. May God bless you.

10 And thank the Court.

11 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am.

12 MS. TIMONEY: Hi. My name is Ashley Timoney. I am
13 the niece of Reverend DePayne Middleton.

14 To the devil sitting here today, I won't even give
15 you the honor of saying your name because you do not deserve
16 the recognition. You've heard about the lives of all of our
17 loved ones, but let me tell you a little bit more about my
18 aunt. We called her Auntie Deb. She was more than an aunt;
19 she was like a second mother to me. And you just heard from
20 my third mother, too, so you know we don't play. I was the
21 first gran, first great-gran growing up. My aunt DePayne
22 named me. She was more than an aunt to me. She was my
23 godmother. I had her all to myself for seven years until
24 Gracie showed up. She supported me in everything I did. She
25 showed us the importance of education, and I grew up learning

1 more from her, more importantly on how to be a good mother as
2 I watched her give herself to her girls every day.

3 Struggling every day, but she did it so gracefully. And so
4 that has taught me how to be with my own son, and it saddens
5 me that while she got a chance to meet him, he will never
6 know what it was like growing up with her.

7 So now that I've educated you a little bit more
8 about what my aunt was to me, let me speak on what you are.
9 How dare you sit here every day looking dumb-faced, acting
10 like you did nothing wrong, and have the nerve to insinuate
11 that you were misled. How dare you even smile or smirk,
12 which I've seen you've done several times throughout these
13 hearings. And I must admit, at many times, I've wanted to
14 wipe that smile off your face myself. But God is still
15 working on me.

16 You are the biggest coward I have ever seen in my
17 life. You are a coward because even as today, you can't even
18 be a man and look at us for the people that we are, and not
19 the animals in that book that you threw on the ground that
20 you thought we were. The very sight of you just makes me
21 sick. The heinous acts that you committed when you decided
22 to walk in a church, a house of God, and take innocent lives
23 because you didn't want -- or because of what you did not
24 like that other blacks were doing across the world, it really
25 shows the kind of person you are -- excuse me -- the kind of

1 animal you are. I have many, many, many choice words that I
2 would love to say to you, but God is working on me. So I
3 shall not. But I will say this: You have sparked many
4 conversations in many houses across America, and blacks and
5 whites, believe it or not, are having those meaningful
6 conversations now, those conversations that people were too
7 afraid to touch on about race. And we are becoming closer.
8 I have, too, become closer with many of my white colleagues,
9 and I'm glad.

10 So to you, your mission failed. Failed, failed,
11 failed, failed. You brought all nine families together, and
12 together we are Charleston strong, and we are the family that
13 love built.

14 THE COURT: If you could state your name for the
15 record, please.

16 MS. DOCTOR: I'm Gracyn Doctor. I'm the daughter of
17 the beautiful, talented Reverend DePayne Middleton Doctor.

18 First I just want to say that, you know, I loved my
19 mom so much. She was the closest person to me, and I really
20 will miss her. It really amazes me how the people with the
21 most hate, the most malice, the most evil in them are always
22 trying to cast what's in them onto everyone else. There
23 wasn't a reason for you doing this. It's not because of
24 anything black people are doing. It's simply because you are
25 Satan himself; and instead of a heart, you have a cold, dark

1 space filled with evil and hate. You will rot in hell where
2 you belong while the beautiful nine lives, the lives that you
3 senselessly stole from us, soar high and their legacies live
4 on. I hope by your sitting waiting to face your death that
5 your conscience and your guilt eats you alive, and hopefully
6 for your sake, while you are pleading to God and begging for
7 your life, because you just can't take it anymore, that he
8 finds it in his heart to forgive you and excuse you for
9 something so unforgivable, the one sin I'm not even sure God
10 can look past. Or hopefully you will go straight to hell
11 because he can't even stand to look at you.

12 Regardless, you and your hate will go right back
13 where you came from where you will spend your eternity. And
14 families, we are strong. We can now really begin to heal
15 from our hurt. Let us go out and live for the loved ones.
16 Let us go out and make them proud, for this spawn of Satan
17 will not steal our joy and will not take the love in our
18 hearts. We are strong. We are black and beautiful, and we
19 can do this.

20 THE COURT: Thank you.

21 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, DePayne's father,
22 Reverend Middleton.

23 REVEREND MIDDLETON: Thank you.

24 God our father, Jesus Christ our redeemer, Holy
25 Spirit our comforter, and I want to thank God for this team

1 that he's blessed us to overlook our justice system, and we
2 will get all justice that is coming to us. I want to thank
3 God for the Judge. I want to thank God for the attorney of
4 laws, the district attorney, and all the other team that
5 worked together to see that we get the justice that we
6 supposed to get.

7 Now to Brother Roof, it's not over for you yet. The
8 group coming back to you. The same group you have destroyed
9 in Emanuel Church on June 17th, they will come back, but they
10 will be led by the archangels and all the company of heaven
11 that come back with that Sunday School book and that lesson.
12 The only thing that be different is they will be greater.
13 They will be the people that you thought you'd destroy. They
14 will be the people that come back to see if they could do
15 anything to save you.

16 I saw my daughter shortly after you shot her. I saw
17 her came into my home, and she is in the angel body. And she
18 wants me to know she is, and all other, are safe and sound, a
19 place they never been before, and they are happy now. So I
20 want to say to you for my family -- and I really feel you
21 took away my daughter and left four children for me to carry,
22 take care, four young ladies, and you took away our pastor,
23 Reverend Clementa Pinckney, Reverend Simmons. Those were my
24 brothers in Christ. They worked together across the years.

25 I had just retired when you shot them. And I

1 listened one Sunday morning, the third Sunday in May, when my
2 daughter preached the sermon that the struggle will soon be
3 over. I listened to Reverend Simmons preach in Emanuel
4 Church, and I sat me in the middle of that church, and I
5 heard over my head the warriors of the angel speaking through
6 Reverend Simmons the word of God. And it really filled my
7 heart and gave my soul a great lift.

8 And Reverend Pinkeye welcome us in that church that
9 Sunday morning. He was teaching Sunday School then, and I
10 arrive at the church. You stop all of that, but it didn't
11 stop. They are in a group led by the great angel, and they
12 are coming after you. They are coming to get your soul
13 ready, see if they can do anything with it and save you so
14 that you could have a chance in heaven like we will.

15 I pray God blessing upon your soul that you will
16 make it in, for they are already in there. And I want to
17 thank this team again. I certainly want to thank you,
18 because I feel lifted up from the justice that was served
19 this week, and how they did diligently take their time and
20 search this thing over and over. I have never heard a
21 computer told that one before, but I heard it this time, and
22 I learned something about it. So may God bless you, and I
23 want to thank the Court for letting me have these words.

24 THE COURT: Thank you, Reverend.

25 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, on behalf of Myra

1 Thompson, her sister Blondelle Gadsden.

2 THE COURT: Good morning. I tell you what: Let's
3 take a break. We have been going about an hour and a half.
4 Let's take about a ten-minute break.

5 (Thereupon, there was a brief recess.)

6 THE COURT: Please be seated.

7 Mr. Richardson, please continue.

8 MR. RICHARDSON: Thank you, Your Honor. This is
9 Blondelle Gadsden.

10 THE COURT: Yes, Ms. Gadsden. Sorry to interrupt
11 you before.

12 MS. GADSDEN: It's quite all right. Thank you for
13 giving me the opportunity to speak this morning. Thank you
14 for the way that you have presided over this court. I'll
15 never look at television law stories the way that I did
16 before after seeing this.

17 THE COURT: This is real life, isn't it?

18 MS. GADSDEN: Yes. Yes.

19 I'm the sister of Myra Thompson, but I first want to
20 talk about the other eight individuals. I'm a life member of
21 Emanuel AME Church, so I had the opportunity of meeting and
22 knowing the other eight individuals, and I just want to say
23 that I know that I have work to do on me. God wasn't ready
24 for me, but I know those nine individuals were children of
25 God, and that warms my heart. I just want to say that there

1 were special things about each of them that allows me to get
2 through each day knowing that I have work to do on me and for
3 me so that I can be the persons that they were -- the person
4 that they were.

5 And Reverend Simmons always reminded me of my dad.

6 I knew two things would happen: He would come with the
7 suit, shirt and tie, and he would have a hat. That was my
8 dad. And so when he would walk up the stairs, they are not
9 first thing he would do was find a resting place for his hat,
10 either on the sill of the window or under the bench where the
11 choir sat. So I will always remember that. I always looked
12 forward to that. Reverend Pinckney, I looked at Reverend
13 Pinckney, and I looked at his two girls, and I can remember
14 the nine girls in my family. So my dad had lots of toting
15 and coaxing, and all those things that Reverend Pinckney
16 would do with his two girls reminded me of my childhood days.
17 So I appreciated the interaction that I saw him having with
18 his children.

19 I think the most significant memory that I'll have
20 is of Tywanza. I saw a young man who from a baby growing up
21 in the church, doing different things too. The ordinary teen
22 that most of us have, you know, sometimes they are happy to
23 be in church; sometimes they are not. A young man that stood
24 in the door, and from one Sunday to the next, there was this
25 big smile, and he was either greeting older members of the

1 church or the young children. And I'll always cherish those
2 memories of him because I know that he grew up to be the
3 young man that his mom and dad taught him to be. And those
4 are the memories that I will hold on to.

5 I have been in this courtroom, and I still have
6 questions about a 21-year-old being convicted to do what he
7 did. But I also know that those questions won't be answered,
8 and so I'm comforted in knowing that there is a court system
9 that -- we've sat through it. We saw the prosecutor team
10 work. We saw the jury work, and I know that God was in this
11 place with us.

12 THE COURT: I want you to know that much of this,
13 just to protect fair trial rights of the defendant, we close
14 proceedings, and that is unfortunate because family members
15 like you wonder, well, what happened in these proceedings?
16 And you will know that. You will have access to it all.

17 MS. GADSDEN: I just want to say that I lost a lot
18 since this tragedy. There were individuals who were faithful
19 members in the church, and I long to have them return to the
20 church and know that they are still a part of the Emanuel
21 family. And I'm hoping that some of this will give them an
22 opportunity to rethink that and return to the church.

23 I lost a sister. I lost a childhood friend. I lost
24 a college roommate. I lost someone who -- when there was a
25 problem or situation in my immediate family or with other

1 siblings, she was the voice of reasoning. I could call her,
2 and no matter what I would tell her that was going on with my
3 children or with our siblings, she would always have a way of
4 reeling me back in to understand, "Well, here is what you
5 need to do. This is what we need to do. This is how we are
6 going to get through this." And so I'm going to miss that.

7 What I have gained from this experience, I have
8 gained a greater sense in God, and I so appreciate my family,
9 my parents for making sure that we went to church and
10 understood what life was all about, the opportunity to just
11 be a part of church and learn how to get up and speak about
12 things that were important to us and to be able to say to the
13 world that no matter what you throw at me, there is a book
14 that I can go to that will help me figure out how I can be
15 the best me no matter what the situation is.

16 And so Dylann has just increased my family. I
17 always knew I had a large family, but I have a larger family
18 now. And I appreciate that. I just want to say that the two
19 things I learned as a child, I learned the 23rd Psalm that
20 taught me why I should forgive and what forgiving meant for
21 me. I learned the Lord's Prayer, and that helped me to know
22 that I always had someone that I could go to, a place that I
23 could go to, someone I could talk to in order to understand
24 that life isn't easy. It's meant to be lived, and sometimes
25 we take the hard knocks with the easy pills that we swallow,

1 but in the end I know that God is a good God, and that He's
2 going to take care of all of us. And so I thank you all for
3 giving me the opportunity to speak.

4 But I say to Dylann, even though he appears to not
5 be listening, I am so glad that he was convicted and making
6 us believe and know that there is nothing mentally wrong with
7 him because I was convicted in believing that there is
8 nothing mentally wrong with him. What I know is the only
9 thing wrong with him is his heart. And when your heart is
10 empty and there is no love, there is no way you can give or
11 receive love. And so I ask God every day not to work on his
12 mind because he has a good mind, I ask God to please work on
13 his heart and give him the strength to be able to love in
14 spite of.

15 So I thank you all.

16 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Gadsden.

17 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Marlene Coakley Jenkins
18 on behalf of Ms. Thompson.

19 THE COURT: Good morning.

20 MS. JENKINS: Good morning, and thank you, Your
21 Honor, for allowing us in your courtroom. This has been a
22 learning experience.

23 THE COURT: For us all, for us all.

24 MS. JENKINS: For all of us. You just heard from my
25 baby sister. I'm really the best child in the family.

1 THE COURT: And your parents told you that.

2 MS. JENKINS: My parents told me that, and I believe
3 that. I know I'm the best child because they whipped me a
4 lot, you know, and whom a parent loved, they will chase them.
5 So I walk away with that.

1 other eight families, most of whom we grew up with. We were
2 pranksters all the time, and being a good prankster took
3 practice. Being whatever you become takes practice. My
4 mission and my plea is for you, Dylann, to take some
5 ownership for who you can be, release what has happened and
6 take ownership for who you can be and be the best you that
7 you could be from this point forward because God has a place
8 for all of us. We don't always know what it is, but there is
9 a place for all of us.

10 And I would like to conclude by saying something
11 about my sister Myra. Myra was probably as long-winded as I
12 am right now, but we spoke on the phone on a regular basis,
13 and sometimes --

14 THE COURT: Long conversations.

15 MS. JENKINS: Yes. Your Honor, sometimes we fell
16 asleep. But we woke up, and we got that conversation
17 finished. Sometimes Denise would call, and she would say,
18 "Oh, I could call back later."

19 And I said, "Yes, you can because I've got my two
20 daughters and my son on hold too. So we are going to have to
21 finish this." And then she retired, and she said in her
22 retirement, "Girl, wait until you retire," and she was right.
23 Retirement is a beautiful thing. So when I retired, we could
24 stay on the phone longer and longer and longer and wake each
25 other up.

1 And I thank you for allowing me to share the
2 humorous side that just reverberates continuously in our
3 household. Thank you, and thank you, and I thank all of you,
4 but I love my new extended family.

5 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am.

6 MR. RICHARDSON: On behalf of Ms. Ethel Lance, this
7 is her daughter Esther.

8 THE COURT: Thank you.

9 Good morning.

10 MS. LANCE: Good morning. I'm Esther Lance. I'm
11 Ethel Lance's daughter.

12 Roof, you took something precious from me. My mama
13 didn't get to see my gran. She get to play with everybody
14 else gran except mine. Right now my baby sister told you she
15 forgive you. My heart ain't there yet. He working on me,
16 but I am still angry with you. The last time I get to see my
17 mama, the Monday when she went to the doctor with me, I got
18 asthma and COPD, bursitis. And I -- what that tragedy did to
19 me, I've been weighing at 295 pounds, now I weigh 132 for
20 dealing with everything we had to go through.

21 So what I need to say to you, when you went out the
22 night, I hope you get to see all nine of them. I wish you
23 could see everybody. This is the gran my momma didn't get to
24 see. So I know for you to put us through this and your own
25 family, to where your mama had a heart attack, so you know

1 how we feel, and I can understand how you feel to put your
2 mama through that. So you know what? I hope you rest
3 tonight because right now, I ain't resting until you get to
4 do what you got to do, but at the end of the day, I still
5 going to be strong because my mama taught me to be strong,
6 even though I'm the coward of the family. But I'm going to
7 be all right because I got to be strong because I got to take
8 care of my gran.

9 So you have yourself a nice day, and I hope you
10 sleep on that.

11 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, next is Ms. Lance's son
12 Gary Washington. He's assisted by two sign language
13 interpreters. Those interpreters have already been sworn in,
14 Your Honor.

15 THE COURT: Thank you. Yes, I'm aware of that.

16 Good morning, Gary.

17 MR. WASHINGTON: Good morning. My name is Gary
18 Washington, and I will speak for my mom.

19 So, Roof, you don't know who my mother was. You
20 don't know anything about us. You don't know anything about
21 our family. We were a family in that church. We loved each
22 other. We took care of each other. We all knew what each
23 other needed and wanted. And I promise you that I will stay
24 in touch with those folks.

25 I went to the church that day with Mom to make sure

1 everything was going well, and she was working that day, and
2 then I went to work myself, and I had some odd premonitions
3 that -- feelings while I was at work, around each other, and
4 just felt like something wasn't right, that something was
5 happening, but I didn't know what it was. And I thought,
6 "It's okay. I'll trust in God in this, and I'll give it to
7 Him because I'm working, and I couldn't do anything." And I
8 noticed all the ambulances and the emergency vehicles passing
9 by at that time when I was at work.

10 And then when I got done with work, I kept trying to
11 contact Mom, and no answer, no response from her, and that
12 was our habit was to contact with each other. So my boss is
13 like, "Go ahead. Go on home." I took off, and the whole
14 area was just lit up with blue and red lights everywhere
15 around the church. And I thought maybe something was
16 happening at the hotel. So I went on home, and then I saw
17 something about the preacher who I loved and that I cared
18 about, that something happened there.

19 So I was running over to the church, but everything
20 was blocked. I couldn't get anywhere near it. And I said,
21 "Does anybody know about my mom? What is going on with my
22 mom?" Nobody knew at the time. I was so upset. No one had
23 any answers yet. And they sent me to the hotel. That's
24 where I went. And everybody was just looking at me when I
25 walked in the door. I was like, "Oh, my gosh," and nobody

1 was -- they were like, "Here is your sister over here. Over
2 here, this is where you need to be."

3 My niece was crying, and I was like, "What's wrong?
4 What's going on?" And my niece called me over, and I was
5 like, "What is it? What's happening? What is going on?"

6 And they said, "Your mother is gone." I just was so
7 freaked out. So my mother is gone? I was so upset. I tried
8 to bring any emotions in because I remember the preacher
9 said, "God will help you. He will cover you," and there are
10 people with us there. We were all talking, and we were all
11 holding hands and praying and trying to keep the faith and
12 remember God will help you, give you faith. Because we had
13 been working to raise money for the elevator for the church
14 and then those people were all killed, all nine people
15 murdered. It was just very depressing.

16 So, Dylann, you don't know about The Word. You
17 don't know how people think and how people look at things. I
18 have been at Columbia many times around the other deaf, black
19 people in that community. I lived there in Columbia for a
20 while, and I have a lot of connections with the deaf-black
21 community, and same thing in Spartanburg. I have a lot of
22 friends in Spartanburg, and they all have been concerned
23 about me. I've seen their kids. I've seen how their kids
24 have grown up. I know the people from the dorm when I went
25 to the school there. And I know people who taught me there

1 at the school for the deaf. And everybody is very concerned
2 for me and worried about me with my mom. So now I just don't
3 want people -- I transferred to a public school, but I don't
4 want people to be so concerned about me and asking me things.

5 So now we just have a family here without my mom,
6 and people are concerned about me. I still have to work and
7 get through the day, but you know, after my mother died, I
8 had this incident with my health situation with my heart. I
9 wasn't feeling well, and I passed out, and now I don't have
10 anybody to help take care of me. Doctors have checked me
11 out. I was in the hospital in the emergency room -- this was
12 in Summerville -- and they checked me over really well, and I
13 just was so upset that my mom was gone.

14 But while I was in the hospital, I woke up at night,
15 and I had all these IVs and stuff attached, and they said,
16 "You can't take those off." And I was having this chest
17 pain. So obviously a lot of my deaf friends and family came
18 by to see me, and I was having trouble sleeping. But during
19 the middle of the night, I woke up, and I saw what I'm sure
20 was my mom, and the nine others all came, and I feel like
21 they just blessed me and told me to calm, that you are going
22 to be okay, and then the spirits left.

23 So to you, Dylann, I know you will be burning in
24 hell.

25 Thank you, Your Honor.

1 THE COURT: Thank you, Gary.

2 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Reverend Sharon Risher.

3 REVEREND RISHER: Dylann, from the very beginning of
4 all of this, I was real vocal about not wanting you to get
5 the death penalty. I was one of the few people that stood
6 outside the box. I still believe that. Even though they
7 convicted you, and you are going to go to die, I still don't
8 want you to die. I want you to be able to sit in that cell.
9 I want you to know that those nine wonderful people that
10 nobody knew about, you have made them martyrs. You have made
11 them the face of America. You have opened doors and given me
12 a platform that I would have never had.

13 You, Dylann, you gave me a voice to go in America,
14 to stand up for each and every person that was affected in
15 that church. I will go to my grave. Every breath that I
16 take will illuminate their lives. I will continue to be the
17 voice of my family. I cannot be my mother. I don't want to
18 be my mother. But I have been given a task of trying to
19 bring a family together that has been torn apart from your
20 heinous crimes. But because of the strength that I have from
21 my mother and from the help that God gives me every day, the
22 fabric that you tore, Dylann Roof, it will be mended no
23 matter how long it takes because God is walking with each and
24 every one of us.

25 So, hopefully, you will get to read the newspapers

1 because you will continue to see me crusading for every one
2 of those nine people and crusading to let America know that
3 guns kill people. They killed nine people in church.

4 May God have mercy upon you.

5 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Najee Washington.

6 MS. WASHINGTON: Good afternoon.

7 THE COURT: Good afternoon.

8 MS. WASHINGTON: My name is Najee Washington, I'm
9 the granddaughter of Ethel Lance.

10 On the witness stand I testified as a granddaughter,
11 but today I will speak as a daughter. My grandmother had
12 five kids, four surviving. While I was in school, my mom
13 passed, and it was hard. But I got through it, just like how
14 I'm getting through this. Everyone asks me, "Are you all
15 right? How are you doing? How are you taking this?"

16 And I say, "I'm fine." And in my heart of hearts, I
17 am fine because I know that she is resting well with my
18 mother in heaven. I'm fine now. I have peace. But since
19 this happened, I felt lost. I felt lost. The place where I
20 grew up in worship was basically transformed into a grave
21 site for nine people. But one night I took a walk on that
22 same walk that my grandmother took. It was at night. I told
23 my boyfriend, "I'm going to take a walk."

24 He was like, "Najee, it's dark out. Are you sure
25 you don't want me to come?"

1 I said, "No, I don't want to be with anyone. I need
2 this for myself." I took that walk. Listening to gospel
3 music because that soothes me, and then I just looked up, and
4 the moon was full, and I started talking to my angels. "Mom,
5 Granny, I'm lost. I feel like a motherless child. I need
6 help. Lord, I need guidance. I need peace." And when I
7 walked back to my car at the hour and 25 minutes, I received
8 just that.

9 So to you, Dylann Storm Roof, you tried to cause
10 harm to everyone in that church that you shot and killed,
11 causing a lot of hurt to all of us; but we bent, we did not
12 break. And you can look down all you want, but I know you
13 hear me. And because of you, you thought you took my
14 grandmother away. You didn't. She is right here. In me. I
15 will carry her to the day I die. I will achieve all the
16 dreams that we have set forth, and they even grew because of
17 you. I just pray that you seek repentance from this.

18 Thank you.

19 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am.

20 MR. WILLIAMS: We are going to call the relatives of
21 Cynthia Hurd.

22 THE COURT: If you could state your name for the
23 record, please.

24 MS. CAPERS: My name is Sheila Capers. Cynthia is
25 my sister-in-law, but more than that, she was my sister, the

1 sister that I never had. She was an aunt to all my children
2 in every sense of the word. Losing her left a gaping hole
3 that will never be filled. She came into our family not as a
4 stranger, but as someone who has always been in our family,
5 and that I love about her. We miss her so much. We love
6 you, Cynthia.

7 While my brother was deployed and I was diagnosed
8 with a heart-related illness, she stepped in and helped me
9 with my mom every day. I will be forever grateful for that.

10 When I was ordained in 2010, Cynthia was more
11 excited than I was. She immediately checked her calendar to
12 see what programs she could plan that I could speak at. I
13 love her for her gentle push. Really miss that. She was
14 everything to my brother. She loved him unconditionally.
15 She was the best thing that ever happened to him. Lord help
16 me.

17 Myra was my friend from childhood. She always had
18 my back. She reminds me a lot of Cynthia because they were
19 both planners, result-oriented. She was an encourager, and
20 one of the best for everyone around her. I miss you, Myra.

21 On June 17th, 2015, Cynthia came by after work. She
22 said that she was tired, and she didn't feel like going to
23 Bible study that night. But she had been working on a
24 project that she needed to present at a meeting before the
25 Bible study. Once Cynthia made the commitment, that was it.

1 She followed through no matter how she felt. At around 9:45,
2 my friend Linda called and said, "I don't know why I'm
3 calling you, but something told me to call you. Something
4 happened at Emanuel."

5 And I thought, "Oh, my God. I hope it's outside."
6 And I got up. I told my mom. She immediately started
7 calling Cynthia on her cellphone. Couldn't get her. And
8 then my mother called -- my brother called. We used to call
9 Cynthia every night to wish her a good night, and he couldn't
10 reach her, so he was wondering if she was there with us. My
11 mom told him what I had told her. Our lives will never be
12 the same. Never. I have not even been able to breathe
13 properly because I'm always worried about my mother and my
14 brother.

15 Dylann, I believe that you can be saved. You can be
16 redeemed. I believe that Jesus could have been redeemed if
17 he had only asked God for forgiveness. I know you don't want
18 to hear what we have to say, but that's okay. That's okay.
19 I pray that God sends someone to you to reach you, to get you
20 to go to God with a sincere heart and seek forgiveness so
21 that when you are executed, you will be able to go to heaven
22 too.

23 I would like to thank you, Judge, for being fair and
24 impartial. I would like to thank the jury members for their
25 service. Jay and his team, Jay was so passionate and

1 compassionate, and I will never forget his passion throughout
2 this process. And I would like to thank the victims'
3 advocates, the counselors, the ministers, everyone that came
4 together and helped us through this terrible process. I want
5 to thank -- I want to thank your family for their kind words
6 that they extended to the families. I can't imagine what
7 they are going through. If at any point before you are sent
8 to prison and you want me to come and pray with you, I will
9 do that.

10 God bless each and every one of you.

11 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am.

12 Good afternoon. Could you state your name for the
13 record, please, sir.

14 MR. MELVIN GRAHAM: My name is Melvin Graham, Melvin
15 L. Graham Jr.

16 THE COURT: Yes, sir.

17 MR. MELVIN GRAHAM: I'm the brother of Cynthia
18 Graham Hurd.

19 First of all, I don't know how to start this off, so
20 I need three seconds to figure this out.

21 THE COURT: Take your time.

22 MR. MELVIN GRAHAM: I just want to speak for my
23 brother Robert. I have three brothers, Robert, Gilbert,
24 Malcolm. My brother Robert has been absent from these
25 proceedings, and he has allowed me to speak for him. He's

1 absent because of the great loss that he feels for my sister.
2 He simply cannot deal with this loss. It's tearing him
3 apart. My brother Robert expresses it in a different way
4 other than appearing here in this courtroom. He maintains
5 our parents' grave. He and Cynthia, that's what they did.
6 They always made sure there were flowers there, and now since
7 Cynthia is gone, he says, "I have to maintain two graves
8 now." He hurts because the night that he executed my sister,
9 my brother said, "How can I go to my mother's grave and tell
10 her her daughter is gone?" He saw himself as the oldest and
11 the protector of Cynthia. Even though she didn't want it, he
12 felt it was his duty to protect Cynthia.

13 So I just wanted to speak for him to let people know
14 that if you don't see him here, it's not that he doesn't
15 care. It's that the grief is just so hard, and he shows it
16 in a different way by making sure that Cynthia's grave is
17 taken care of. And just as he goes and speaks to my mother
18 and father, he goes and speaks to her.

19 My brother Gilbert is not here. He has allowed me
20 to speak for him. My brother Gilbert, and the second oldest,
21 soft-spoken, quiet, after this tragedy happened, Gilbert has
22 come really out of his comfort zone. He has reached out and
23 taken that role that Robert had and Cynthia had, to be a
24 protector for the family, to be a protector for me, Malcolm,
25 and my sister Averill.

1 My sister Averill is not here; she has allowed me to
2 speak for her. Her words are a little bit more measured, but
3 basically I want to just say that she is hurting. My sister
4 found out that she had cancer and Cynthia was going to put
5 together the plan to treat her. Cynthia said to me in a
6 conversation we had when she found out, "I'm going to get my
7 sister. I'm going to bring her home, and I'm going to take
8 care of her." That's the love she had for my sister.

9 Jackie had to go through chemotherapy -- no. I'm
10 sorry -- surgery, chemotherapy, radiation all by herself
11 without her sister by her side. The first person Jackie
12 called for when she awoke from the anesthesia was Cynthia.
13 It's hard on her. She is not here with the family. She's in
14 Virginia, and she grieves every day.

15 So I just wanted to speak for them because they have
16 allowed me to speak for them. And I want to speak for me.

17 When my sister was executed -- that is what it was,
18 an execution -- it tore me apart. It tore me apart. I loved
19 my sister. I remember when we were children, and I was a
20 child, and Dad called and said, "Your mama had a little
21 girl," and I remember my two older brothers and I are jumping
22 up and down. I remember taking Cynthia for walks. I
23 remember playing with her. And the last thing I did for my
24 sister when we got to the cemetery, I carried her the last
25 step of the way. I done all I can.

1 In the passing of my sister, this individual
2 unleashed a hell spawn on the family. We lost our home. We
3 lost familiar possessions. We lost things that belonged to
4 my grandmother, my grandfather. We lost so much. The pain
5 was magnified. It's hard.

6 I heard Dylann stand here and say, "You don't know
7 what hate is." You are right. I don't have the capacity to
8 hate. I tried. The hatred that you possess is beyond human
9 comprehension. But that is your problem. But like everyone
10 else has said, you have the opportunity that you didn't give
11 my sister. You chose to take her life. But you have an
12 opportunity, just like my sister has, to live again. She's
13 gone on to heaven to start her second life. You have a
14 chance to start yours.

15 But I'm going to share something with you because
16 I'm not going to stand up here long. You said we don't know
17 what hate is. Well, I'm going to tell you and show you what
18 love is. Just pardon me for a minute. This is what love is.
19 You wanted to start a race war. You wanted people to kill
20 each other, but instead of starting a race war, you started a
21 love war. What you did pulled people together in a way that
22 I did not know could happen.

23 So let me tell you what a love war looks like, what
24 the people of this community did because of your actions.
25 They got together, and I'm not here to brag, but this is what

1 they did for my sister: The Cynthia Graham Hurd St. Andrews
2 Regional Library, by the people; Cynthia Graham Hurd
3 Scholarship, College of Charleston; the Cynthia Graham Hurd
4 Charleston County Housing Authority Scholarship; the Cynthia
5 Graham Hurd Fellowship, University of South Carolina;
6 Memorial tree and bench, Gaillard Auditorium; Cynthia Graham
7 Hurd Scholarship; Dart Library; Memorial bike rack, Dart
8 Library; Cynthia Graham Hurd Memorial Fund, Charleston County
9 library; Cynthia Graham Hurd and the Emanuel Nine recognized
10 by the University of South Carolina on their calendar;
11 history calendar, African-Americans; arch of triumph, John C.
12 Smith; Cynthia Graham Hurd Foundation, started by her family,
13 supported by the people who love her; Cynthia Graham Hurd and
14 the Emanuel Nine, instrumental in removing the Confederate
15 Flag.

16 Soon to come, Emanuel Nine Memorial, Emanuel AME
17 Church; memorial garden and marker, College of Charleston;
18 Cynthia Graham Hurd Scholarship, Clark Atlanta University,
19 a/k/a sorority, and this is just what I can come up with off
20 the top of my head. There is more that I can't even
21 remember.

22 And I'm not here to brag because other family
23 members are doing the same thing and have the same tributes,
24 but I would give it all back, every bit of it, every penny
25 that was donated, I would give it all back to have my sister

1 back again. But what you've done, what God has done, God has
2 given her a life beyond this life. My sister lives in this
3 city. She lives in this state. She lives in this nation. I
4 am surrounded by my sister everywhere I go. I'm surrounded
5 by strangers who said, "Your sister helped me, encouraged
6 me." I'm surrounded by children who said, "I remember your
7 sister when I was a little girl and I used to go to the
8 library and how nice she was."

9 There is a passage in the Bible that says, "We
10 entertain angels unaware." I had one in my family. I had
11 one in my family, unaware. My parents worked themselves to
12 death to educate us, to give us the best, and they succeeded.
13 I'm proud of them. I'm proud of my family. My sister had no
14 children, but now every scholarship, someone, somewhere will
15 be calling out her name, Cynthia Graham Hurd.

16 THE COURT: Yes, sir. If you could state your name
17 for the record.

18 MR. MALCOLM GRAHAM: My name is Malcolm Graham.

19 THE COURT: I know who you were. That was for the
20 record.

21 MR. MALCOLM GRAHAM: I don't think I have much left
22 to say. My mother told my brothers and sisters -- and you
23 can hear the passion from my brother Melvin -- that when one
24 of her children cry, the others should moan. She didn't tell
25 us how we should act when one of our siblings is killed by a

1 white racist. I choose to do what Cynthia would have wanted
2 me to do which is to stand up and speak out. And I'll take
3 this opportunity to address the Court one last time.

4 We want to thank from the Graham family the Court,
5 the court officials, the attorneys for your support to
6 ensuring that justice is done. We want to thank this
7 fraternity of family members that we are a part of now for
8 hugging me and hugging us when we were down and lifting our
9 spirits and occasionally a shoulder to cry on. We thank them
10 from my family.

11 One of the things that I know that my sister would
12 have wanted me to do was to use my public voice to talk about
13 what happened that night in our hometown, to talk about
14 hatred and racism and discrimination, and to talk about the
15 impact it has on people's lives. 2015, we are still dealing
16 with these issues in our court system, in our employment
17 system, in our educational system. All have traces of bias
18 and racism. But in Charleston a year and a half ago, racism
19 was on full display. We know what racism and hatred looks
20 like. It looks like him. We know what it sounds like. It
21 sounds like him.

22 There is no place in a civilized society for racism,
23 hatred, and discrimination. There is no place in America's
24 smallest jail for racism, hatred, and discrimination. This
25 community has demonstrated that love conquers hate.

1 These family members and my family members from nine
2 different walks of life, all have one thing in common, that
3 we love our relatives, and we want them back. But that can't
4 happen. We all know what happened. We heard the evidence,
5 and the jury rendered a decision. I can live with that
6 decision. There is just no place for forgiveness in this
7 community for hatred and racism and discrimination. There is
8 no room for it. There is no room for him.

9 THE COURT: Thank you, sir.

10 Yes, sir, state your name for the record.

11 MR. HURD: Arthur Steven Hurd.

12 I stand here today, and on a political and economic
13 tirade, it's not necessary. It's all stated all the time.
14 Today I would rather talk to my wife, Cynthia Marie Hurd.
15 She may not be here in the physical form, but she's here. I
16 was, I am, and I forever will be her number one. If you look
17 up wife in the Webster's dictionary, in my heart I feel is a
18 picture of her that says see her. She is that word.

19 Mr. Roof, much like you, I -- unlike you, I chose to
20 obtain a degree in physics, chemistry, and math education.
21 Much like you, I was a loner. Unlike you, I love a woman
22 named Cynthia Hurd. I came out of that. Love conquers all.
23 My sister spoke today, and she offered to pray for you at the
24 end if necessary. I'm not that way. I'm just not that way.
25 I don't hate you. I know she would have forgiven you. And a

1 good friend of mine, Jack Ellis, said, I have to forgive you.
2 Some -- some stand still, and some days I'll fall back
3 because it's just too darn heavy. I want you to know when
4 I'm at that point, she is wearing blue slacks, black heels,
5 shirt on, hair pulled back in a ponytail with a blue ribbon,
6 a bag, and I jumped out of a car doing 15 miles an hour just
7 to introduce myself to her because I knew I was going to
8 marry her.

9 We have been through life's ups and downs. Had
10 arguments, there were days that she came home upset about
11 things at work and people in the church, and I would hold her
12 from behind, and I would whisper in her ear, "Baby,
13 everything is going to be okay" several times.

14 And she calmed down, and she looked me in the eyes
15 and said, "You treat me like a little girl some days, and I
16 love it." I miss that about her. I miss the playing with
17 radio control cars. That's the real side. Holding hands and
18 taking a walk through Hampton Park, those days I'll never
19 have again. I'm blaming myself because I wasn't able to
20 protect her. Because of my training, I can't say everybody
21 would be alive. I know she may be standing here. I may not
22 be standing here. You wouldn't be sitting there. For that I
23 can assure you. At the end of the day, she always told me,
24 "Steve, if you could find a way to tell me something and I
25 could see it move in my head, then you succeeded." I never

1 got that until this morning. I got a phone call at 0600
2 hours. He said, "Steve, I had a problem. I sat down like
3 you would think, and I saw things move in my head, and I
4 realized what to do. I heard Cynthia. She is present,
5 forever walks, forever will, and forever shall be." I
6 keep -- when he sang that song, it had some kind of insight
7 into this in me.

8 The late great Marvin Gaye wrote, produced, and sang
9 "Trouble Man." He must have future vision in me because that
10 is my life now. I sleep two hours a night. I eat one meal a
11 day. I can't stand to be in the kitchen; I cooked for her.
12 I was in bed before she went to work.

13 To the family, I'm sorry for your loss, also,
14 because Sharonda was a true friend to my wife, and anything
15 that was good for and good to Cynthia was good for and good
16 to me. You all should be proud. The Pinckney family, my
17 wife was on the lay organization. There were nights I went
18 to meetings with her, and Reverend Pinckney and I would sneak
19 into his office. He put the radio on the desk, and we would
20 play -- please forgive us, God, for this one -- Big Daddy
21 Kane, Public Enemy in his office, and go back and forth over
22 the finer points of rap music, and then CCR or the Lynyrd
23 Skynyrd band, and we would discuss what was going on in the
24 world at the time, what we were doing at that time in our
25 lives. He played golf; I fly fish. Both sports take

1 control, precision, and tenacity, qualities that I can assure
2 you today that you do not possess. He will forever be
3 known -- and I want the world to know this -- as the best
4 minister Emanuel ever had, has had, or will ever have. You
5 all should be proud. Quite simple. Proud.

6 I will tell you, I no longer attend Mother Emanuel
7 AME Church, or any other AME church for that matter. Because
8 of you and what you did to my wife, true colors of the
9 hierarchy came out, and I was able to see that and step away.
10 Thank you, Cynthia. My sister, my brother ran around during
11 that time. We had a family conflict going on, but due to
12 you, you brought the trio back together. What a wonderful
13 thing. What a wonderful thing.

14 I feel the pain in her brothers and her sister every
15 day. They grew up with her. I loved her. I was married to
16 her. We shared secrets that the -- if the world only knew.
17 I remember the day I asked to marry Cynthia. It was
18 Christmas morning. I was gone fishing. I have your
19 engagement ring covered by three bags of worms. When you
20 unwrapped it and opened it, you saw the worms and went,
21 "Well, okay."

22 And I said, "You know I love to fish, but today I'm
23 going for a bigger fish." I pulled the worms back, pulled
24 out her ring, got on one knee and asked her to marry me.

25 For the love of God, I still don't understand why

1 you did what you did. For the love of God, I want you to
2 know that my life will never be the same again. The great
3 Reverend Magamore (ph), who I respect, who knew my wife and
4 knew me, told Cynthia and I both two days before we said I
5 do, "Whenever you have a conflict, whenever ugly words are
6 said, remember the only thing and the one thing that can make
7 you whole again is the blood of Jesus." So my sister, the
8 only thing that can make you whole again is the blood of
9 Jesus. He will forever be known as the greatest of all AME
10 ministers because while eulogizing my wife, our governor, who
11 diligently worked to bring that flag down, said after his
12 sermon, "He made me want to become an AME." You did that.
13 So thank you. You, I got you. So from the Hurds, Pauline,
14 Sheila, myself, Francis, Fran, and Tonia.

15 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Ms. Eva Dilligard,
16 Susie Jackson's sister, and her daughter Denise Dilligard.

17 MS. DILLIGARD: Hello.

18 THE COURT: Good afternoon.

19 MS. DILLIGARD: Good afternoon. My name is Eva
20 Jackson Dilligard.

21 THE COURT: You are one of the travelers.

22 MS. DILLIGARD: Yes. My sister Susie was like the
23 second mother to us. There was ten of us, and she really
24 thought that wherever we go wrong, she will correct us. We
25 thought she was really like a millionaire because whenever we

1 fall short, she was there for us. I -- you took the love of
2 our life, the matriarch, and you can imagine my sister saying
3 to you, "Son, don't do that." So now I am the oldest in the
4 family that is left. And I love my sister, but God have
5 mercy on you.

6 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Eva.

7 If you could state your name for the record, please.

8 MS. SMALLS: Good afternoon. My name is Denise
9 Dilligard Smalls.

10 I'm here today to say to the Court and everyone
11 along the way, I thank you all. I thank you all for being
12 there for the nine victims family along with the survivors.

13 I'm standing here. I had things I wanted to say,
14 but they stopped me. God would not allow me to say in this
15 courtroom today some of the things that I really wanted to
16 say. To Dylann Storm Roof, you say you can't look at us. I
17 can't look at them. I can't even see what I'm saying to
18 y'all. I can't look at them. I was taught that when you
19 speak, look into the eyes, look into the eyes. I know you
20 can hear me.

21 And my heart it's been broken in many pieces,
22 millions of pieces throughout my family and the victims'
23 family along with the survivors. Throughout the world our
24 hearts have been broken, but hate, hate brought love with
25 unity. All I can say today is you took away three people --

1 Three out of the nine in my family: the matriarch, Susie
2 Jackson, Tywanza Sanders, and Ethel Lance, and I accept all
3 of the other victims family in my life. Today I want you to
4 understand I'm looking at you, and you won't even look at me,
5 but I know you can hear me.

6 When I came up anything you do on the outside, and
7 you knew better from the inside, by the time you got home,
8 mom, dad, and everybody else was waiting on you there.
9 Neighbors could correct you. Teachers could correct you.
10 The church members, everybody could correct us. All I want
11 you to know, all I want you to hear -- could you look at me?
12 Could you look at me? Okay.

13 I'm going to accept that. But understand, Aunt
14 Susie's house, Tywanza's house, Ethel Lance's house, the nine
15 houses, Mother Emanuel house, the State house, the White
16 House, always remember justice has been served to you.
17 Understand one thing, to redefine some of the things and some
18 of what you were doing, it wasn't right, but I'm not here to
19 judge you. All I have to say to you today is remember what
20 you got yesterday. You deserve it.

21 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Cynthia Taylor.

22 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am. Good afternoon.

23 MS. TAYLOR: Good afternoon. My name is Cynthia
24 Taylor, and I'm Susie Jackson godchild/niece. I was the
25 first girl in her life, and she was the first in my life. I

1 could recall -- and I want you to understand all of my
2 childhood memories. I can recall my first Shirley Temple. I
3 knew my hair wasn't long enough. She told me you can get
4 whatever you want. And I got it. I might not be shaking and
5 hanging all over the place, but, hey, it was what I wanted
6 and what she wanted me to have.

7 As I grew older, I knew she was a very spiritual
8 individual. As we grow older, we knew we went to Sunday
9 School. We went to church, but decided that we would fall on
10 the wayside. She came. She said, "You know what? Your life
11 would be better if you put a little bit more of God inside of
12 you." So my first step for me is I joined the choir. I also
13 realized she was in the choir too. So it made it even
14 better. Life was better for me, and it was a joy for her.

15 We knew all the time that we had somebody special.
16 I could remember as a young child, she was slim, tall, meek,
17 and mild. My uncle got sick. She had to care for my uncle.
18 She was very scornful at first. She didn't want to touch
19 anything. But each day she took care of my uncle, she began
20 to get stronger.

21 She had four brothers, six sisters. I watched my
22 aunt. As my grandfather died, my aunt took on the whole
23 family. She made a way out of no way for every one of those
24 children. I watched her bury every one of my uncles. Then
25 came my mom. Then came my aunt Justine, I watched my aunt.

1 I watched my aunt go from a young lady to old woman. I
2 watched her every day walking to our church. Some days it
3 was -- she was very fast with walking, and then I saw her the
4 days with her cane. But she never forgot that door of
5 Emanuel. Never. The greatest joy for her was to have her
6 70th birthday in the church.

7 I knew even before that that was her home. And I
8 know in my heart -- I didn't want her to die, but what better
9 place but Emanuel because she loved it. She loved that
10 place, and she loved her family, every one of those sisters,
11 actually including her was six and an outside, an adopted,
12 that they made their sister. Adopted for them to be the
13 Jackson 5. Although it was the Jackson 7, she made it the
14 Jackson 5. But we loved every moment of her. We had a
15 family reunion. She was the person, wasn't loud, always was
16 that mild-mannered individual, but in our way, we got the
17 eye. We got the sigh. We knew that meant something.

18 We gave her the name Reverend Tutu. The Reverend
19 Tutu was a person get the job done, do it the right way. I
20 don't have to have a stake on you all, but you know what
21 you've got to do. We did it. You know what we got from
22 that? We got the smile. We knew that the job was well done.
23 We knew we did a good job.

24 And now to look at you and to know that you took our
25 joy away from us, you can't even replace her. I had a cousin

1 Tywanza Sanders, Ethel Lance. I had six other church
2 members, I can't even have them back again because of you.
3 I'm not going to say go to hell, but you know Satan got your
4 mind now, but God is going to find it later, and that is all
5 I got to say about you.

6 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, Ms. Gail Jackson.

7 THE COURT: Good afternoon.

8 MS. G. JACKSON: Good afternoon. I am the niece of
9 Susie Jackson, the daughter of the baby sister of my Aunt
10 Susie Jackson.

11 I want to tell you, I want your soul to burn in
12 hell. I ask God to have mercy on your mother's soul. Today
13 my mother can't even step her foot in the church. On every
14 first Sunday as we take communion, I cry because I miss
15 seeing my aunt marching down from upstairs, singing "One day
16 at a time, sweet Jesus." So to stand here, to see you sit
17 there and can't even never ever through this whole trial say,
18 "I'm sorry. I was wrong," it hurts me.

19 I think back two weeks before my aunt got killed in
20 the church. I was on my lunch break -- I work right around
21 the corner from my aunt -- and I went there. It was a
22 midnight break, and I went to the gas station, and I saw a
23 man in her driveway. So I called Aunt Susie's house; the
24 phone didn't ring. I called my mom; the phone didn't ring.
25 So I called Aunt Eve; Aunt Eve, she didn't answer. I called

1 my cousin who lived upstairs with Aunt Susie, Ayana; no one
2 answered. So I called my mom again. I said, "Mama, you
3 know, I ride past and I see a man on Aunt Susie's gate."

4 She said, "Huh." So Aunt Susie call me back, Gail,
5 I said, "I see somebody in your driveway." I said, "But
6 don't go outside. I can't stop. I have to go back to work.
7 Call the police. Aunt Susie," I said, "call the police."
8 Aunt Susie called me with the policeman on the line. So I'm,
9 "Aunt Susie, I'm at work. I ain't supposed to be on the
10 phone."

11 I got these people on three-way, these people out
12 here, fool. I said, "Aunt Susie, I am between the car. I
13 can't talk."

14 So she said, "Gail, I need you to tell the people
15 what you see because I'm not going out there."

16 So my mom called me back, and she said, "Gail," she
17 said, "I know you can't talk, but we need you to tell the
18 policeman what you seen."

19 So I said, "Mommy, I can't talk. I'm going to get
20 in trouble." So at the time -- at the time I had to go and
21 sneak in the bathroom, and I called Aunt Susie and I
22 explained to her, let her know where I was at and what was
23 going on.

24 So she said, "Gail, that was one of Ethel Lance
25 family member came and told me that they had death in the

1 family."

2 So I said, "Well, Aunt Susie, I apologize, but who
3 is this man? Why was he in your driveway? Why was he in the
4 gate at 1, maybe 12:30 in the morning?"

5 She said, "He fall asleep because he get tired
6 waiting on me to answer the door."

7 So I said, "Well, Aunt Susie, I've got to go back to
8 work. I got to go back to work."

9 So she said, "Call me later." So to make a long
10 story short, the following week when I heard about the
11 tragedy, I found out it was Aunt Susie, I was hurt because I
12 feel that I wasn't there to protect her. Sometimes I feel
13 like how can I get over not being there? Why wasn't I there?
14 And I left Emanuel, and I branched off to another church.
15 Because I couldn't get an understanding -- I couldn't get an
16 understanding of the pastor and what he was explaining.
17 Every pastor teach different. So I came back to Emanuel, and
18 I just keep hearing in my head from Aunt Susie telling me, "I
19 told you we needed you back. The things you was doing in the
20 other church, you could have been helping us here."

21 So I'm here back at my home church where I was born
22 and raised, in Emanuel, to help us, to help everyone to get
23 over this. But I can't. It's hard, and for you to sit here
24 every day -- I was here from the beginning to the end -- and
25 never ever apologize to neither one of our families, none of

1 the Emanuel 9, it's hurtful. So that is why I'm going to
2 tell you I pray that your soul go to hell.

3 MR. RICHARDSON: Ayana and Walter, junior, Jackson.

4 THE COURT: Very good.

5 MS. A. JACKSON: Good morning.

6 THE COURT: Good morning.

7 MS. A. JACKSON: My name is Ayana Graham Jackson,
8 and I just want to correct something. Walter is no longer a
9 junior. He's the third. He found out --

10 THE COURT: Straightened him out on that.

11 MS. A. JACKSON: We just found out that information.
12 I am the daughter-in-law of Susie Jackson --
13 daughter-in-law/daughter.

14 Susie's an incredible, unexplainable person for me.
15 Along with Tywanza's family, along with the Lance family, we
16 all grew up in the projects. Of course, I was on the better
17 side of town, and I was on the east side, and they were on
18 the west side. But we shared a lot in the church, Emanuel,
19 as you went to church and Sunday School together, and we went
20 to Sunday School like Bible study because we were taught
21 love. We were taught who God was, and who he will continue
22 to be, in spite of our downfalls. We also got a glimpse of
23 segregation and hate, but we were taught love because Emanuel
24 also housed the civil rights movement where a lot of us
25 participated in, and we grew to know that love overpowers

1 hate, in spite of it all.

2 Walter and I grew up together. We grew up together
3 around most of the family members that you see here, so
4 knowing that all of these families are totally connected
5 because we may all be cousins in some respect, I guess we may
6 be, but in the meantime, Emanuel housed us and taught us so
7 much. As we grew under the watchful eyes of Susie and Eva
8 and the rest of the sisters, they watched us in their love of
9 the church in the choir, and we would sneak and eat candy and
10 go to the store, and she was always there to lead and guide
11 us in spite of what we tried to do.

12 We started officially dating in high school, even
13 though we grew up together, but we dated in high school, and
14 we also as we went through high school and his years in the
15 service and mine in college, Susie also supported me
16 financially and sent me care packages. Of course, I was
17 dating her son, so she wanted to make sure she kept a close
18 eye on me as well. In helping me, she also nurtured me in a
19 lot of things that I had problems with. And nurturing me,
20 she taught me the guidance of a mother, and that's why I said
21 I'm just like her daughter as well.

22 A special bond that happened during my time period
23 as her daughter came when Annette arrived. Eva did not share
24 this story with you, but she told me I could share it. The
25 bond that two sisters have goes beyond sisterhood when it

1 comes to Eva. Eva is a very modest person, and I call her
2 Aunt Eve. Everybody calls her Aunt Eve. Eva carried a child
3 for nine months for her sister because her sister had lost
4 her husband. Eva carried a child, and when that child was
5 born, Eva called her sister and told her she had a girl.
6 That girl was Annette. Annette was adopted by Susie.

7 When Annette found out she was adopted, Annette
8 shared -- I was in the household when Annette came. She
9 said, "Mommy, they are telling me that is my brother. They
10 are telling me that is my sister. Is that true?" And she
11 said yes, but she said, "But, Mommy, that makes me special.
12 I have an aunt who is my mother. And I have a mother who is
13 my aunt." What a special love the two sisters shared between
14 the child. So Annette was my baby sister, and she was so
15 proud when Bernie came along because Bernie was there for
16 seven years alone. So I guess he was the favorite grandson.

17 And in the meantime when Ina came, Susie was jumping
18 up and down. Ina was the first girl, especially after nine
19 years between the two of them. The bond that Susie had with
20 her grandchildren, the bond that she had with her son as they
21 spoke on the phone every Sunday about what they were cooking
22 to try to make me feel bad, they shared the dish, they shared
23 the love, they shared the connection.

24 Walter is the oldest of 36-plus grans, and there is
25 over 200-some-plus in the family, but he is still one of the

oldest. And in the meantime, the love and inspiration that Susie gave to this family can never be taken away. The love and the inspiration that she inspired in all of us, including the nine families that we are connected with, that was shared. You may have taken a life, but our souls and their souls live with us forever. The love and the connection and the memories that we have will keep us going.

And I just hope that every one of you here know that we thank all of you for the conditional love that just pops up as we walk by you. It's a love that overpowers everything. We can feel it, and we can feel your love and grace, and we want to say thank you as the Jackson family. I'm thanking you for Walter. Walter is not up here, but I'm thanking you for him as well. And thanking all of you. God bless.

MR. WILLIAMS: The next group we have are people, friends from the church.

THE COURT: I think it's probably a good time for lunch. We have been going for about an hour and a half. Let's take a one-hour lunch break and resume at 2:00.

MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you, Your Honor.

(Thereupon, there was a lunch recess.)

THE COURT: Please be seated. Mr. Williams?

MR. WILLIAMS: The next group we have for you are
at are leadership with the church.

1 THE COURT: Glad to hear from anyone.

2 Good afternoon.

3 MS. SANDERS: Good afternoon. My name is Doris
4 Sanders. I'm a member of Emanuel AME Church.

5 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am.

6 MS. SANDERS: The tragic murders that occurred with
7 the nine members of my church changed my life forever. It is
8 hard for me to believe that someone had violated my church, a
9 place where I found joy, comfort, friendship, love, joy, and
10 sorrow. I felt sadness, anger, confusion, insecure. My
11 emotions were not only due to the inadequacy of my faith, but
12 I had just left the church an hour earlier. I loved those
13 nine members whose lives were taken in such a tragic way, but
14 I want you to know that all of that tragedy occurred at my
15 church, the doors of my church were never closed. They
16 remained open. And although I'm not a blood relative of the
17 victims, they were my christian brothers and sisters. And
18 being with the families of the victims throughout this trial
19 helped me to know that while each of the victims were amazing
20 persons, they came from incredible families.

21 THE COURT: And an amazing church.

22 MS. SANDERS: Yes. And I am asking in your presence
23 that they adopt me as a member of the family.

24 THE COURT: Do I hear a motion?

25 MS. SANDERS: I will expect to be invited to

1 Christmas dinners and Thanksgiving dinners, and if they fail
2 to do that, I will come back to your court.

3 THE COURT: Come back and see me.

4 MS. SANDERS: It has also amazed me how such great
5 love could come out of a tragic situation. I have known
6 nothing but love and caring and respect from people in the
7 community as well as in my church. And although I ask the
8 question where was Jesus amidst this event, amidst this
9 tragedy, I found the answer. Jesus was right with the
10 victims as he is right with us now.

11 And I also had to understand why they were willing
12 to give forgiveness, but I came to realize that they were
13 willing to give forgiveness because they knew their families
14 were in heaven with Jesus. And I thank them for that. I
15 also know that mercy is married to justice because that is
16 what I have seen in the Courts today. And my goal in life
17 from this day will be to attend every meeting and session
18 where there is a discussion on race and culture in this
19 community and wherever I can travel. I am an 82-year-old
20 member of Emanuel. So there are times when I may not be able
21 to make the meetings, but this fall I have attended three of
22 them, one on Sunday. And I hope the Lord will continue to
23 let me live so that I can participate in those discussions
24 that will make this world a better place for everyone.

25 Our journey is not over yet. And I want the family

1 to know that the journey is not over for them either, but
2 they will have to recall those scriptures and those hymns and
3 those long sermons that we sit through and pull on that, the
4 love of each other, and the love for everyone in this world
5 because that is what God wants us to do.

6 God bless that family, and I hope they will have
7 many, many joyous and happy days. Thank you.

8 THE COURT: Thank you very much.

9 Good afternoon.

10 MS. SPENCER: Good afternoon, Your Honor.

11 THE COURT: Give us your name for the record,
12 please.

13 MS. SPENCER: My name is Marcia Spencer.

14 As a Midwestern transplant by way of New York City,
15 almost 23 years ago, I became a member of Emanuel AME Church.
16 It reminded me of the AME church where I had grown up in
17 northwest Ohio, also an historic black church. So I speak to
18 you today not as a family member because I wasn't related to
19 anyone, nor did I have the privilege of having met and gotten
20 to know all of the nine. That is my loss. A loss that your
21 evil actions snatched away in the evening hours of June 17th,
22 2015. Even though there were no family connections or
23 acquaintances of all who died, I was broken in such a way I
24 have yet to find words that remotely come close to describing
25 the, at the present time, horror and grief.

1 Now, multiply that by infinity, and maybe one could
2 begin to grasp the agony of relatives and friends of the
3 Emanuel 9. What are you? What kind of subhuman miscreant
4 could commit such evil? Your twisted desire to ignite a race
5 war is not even original. Others long before you were born.
6 Each thought they could do the same thing: Timothy McVeigh,
7 Charles Manson, Adolph Hitler. After the deaths of tens,
8 hundreds, and millions of innocents, they, too, failed
9 miserably. On the first day of jury selection, I couldn't
10 even walk into this courtroom. I turned and ran away, afraid
11 to look into the face of evil. But we all must look into the
12 face of evil and stand up to it wherever and whenever it
13 appears.

14 What happened to you, Dylann? You are of the
15 millennial generation that is the future of this nation and
16 the world. What happened to you? Perhaps, like Judas, you
17 were destined never to be anything other than a pathetic and
18 reviled excuse for a human being. So today to replace the
19 horrific images stuck in my head of my pastor and church
20 friends, the last image I want to see of you is you being led
21 away in handcuffs to begin and await your gruesome destiny.

22 THE COURT: Good afternoon.

23 MS. MARTIN: Good afternoon. My name is Ruby
24 Martin. I believe I'm the most senior member of the church
25 at this time. I'm a lifelong member of Mother Emanuel. And

1 I am humbled to have this opportunity to speak on behalf of
2 my wonderful church family members, now known as the Emanuel
3 9.

4 I miss them sincerely. I was devastated by the act
5 of June 17th. I had just left the church. I had to put my
6 life on hold, seek counseling, lost control of my legs. I
7 could not return to my church for a long period of time.
8 When you have attended nine wakes and nine funerals, it is
9 heartbreaking.

10 But I want to talk a little bit about the wonderful
11 members that we've lost. Susie Jackson. Susie was my
12 sister's high school friend. They allowed me to tag along
13 with them to the community center, and while we could have
14 fun there, when it was time to leave, they redirected me in a
15 different direction so that they could meet the fellows
16 around the corner. Susie was joyful, but no nonsense. She
17 said what she had to say, and you listened. When we got out
18 of hand, she brought us back in, and we respected that. She
19 was a member of the women's life ministry at our church. A
20 good speaker, she loved to sing. She loved family. We knew
21 the Jackson family.

22 Reverend Clementa Pinckney, I met Reverend Pinckney
23 when he was 13 years old at Grace AME Church in Beaufort,
24 South Carolina. He was being presented to the annual
25 conference for membership and admissions to preach. I looked

1 around, and I told my friend, "That is a baby. He's only
2 13." But you could look at him and tell that he was called
3 by God. He was young, sincere, and we respected him. I was
4 there when he received his ordination. Little did I know
5 that later on he would become my pastor. I was also present
6 for the baptism of his youngest daughter at Campbell Church
7 in Bluffton, South Carolina. We shared many of our works
8 across the church.

9 The last time I talked to my pastor was on my way
10 out. We talked about the beautiful socks that he was
11 wearing. He was very colorful that night, and I said to him,
12 "I sure love those socks."

13 He said, "The girls gave it to me, and I have to
14 wear it tonight." And he said to me -- it was about
15 100 degrees -- "Sister Martin, go home, get something to eat
16 and take a rest." That was the last time I saw this man that
17 I have known since he was 13 years old.

18 Sharonda and Myra were my mentees. They sought me
19 when they were going into the ministry. I was so proud of
20 them. I attended their admissions and ordination for
21 Sharonda. Sharonda was also a member of my sorority. You
22 could call on her for anything. So I tried to provide them
23 with educational materials to enhance their work in the
24 ministry.

25 Reverend Simmons worked with me on several

1 activities at the general church AME church. We called him
2 "super dad." He was colorful, and he was a real character.
3 He was no reality preacher. He was the real deal. He told
4 you what you needed to know or needed to hear, not what you
5 wanted. He shot straight from the hip. And we loved him.
6 We were angry with him a lot, but we loved him. He was an
7 excellent administrator.

8 Cynthia, I knew from a young child. We saw her grow
9 up in the church, go away to college. She was also a member
10 of my sorority. I saw her bloom into a beautiful woman.
11 Beautiful woman, well dressed, well loved. At the library
12 she would come to the door when she saw homeless people
13 standing around. She would bring them in and put them on the
14 computer. And, hey, what are you going to do with this? But
15 that made them feel real good, and she had quite a few of
16 them to learn some computer skills. At Dart Library, it was
17 not the same when she left and moved to St. Andrews, but we
18 loved her. She loved the library, and she would just come
19 out the door and say "hi" to everybody.

20 Tywanza, I was just getting to know this beautiful
21 young man. He was something else. I heard him read some of
22 his poetry, and he read so long, we almost had to stop him.
23 He had a book of them, and he was just going on. But we
24 loved him, and he was a graduate of my alma mater, Allen
25 University. I miss him, too.

DePayne was a newcomer to the church. I had heard her sing many times in different choirs around. She enjoyed the ministry, and we enjoyed her. And just when she was beginning to bloom, she was no longer here. We miss her and her lovely daughters, but I know that she is smiling on us.

Ethel, Ethel Lance was a wonderful woman. In 1978 when I was serving as assistant principal of a middle school, I met her through her daughter Nadine. And after many conversations, she decided to work with us in the PTA. Wonderful spirit and we enjoyed each other, and that kept everybody intact. I didn't have to worry because I could call Ethel Lance. She wanted the best of education for her children, and I think she achieved that. She took the job at the church as our sexton. Some days I would find her at Sam's with a basket high of everything, and I would say, "What are you doing?"

"Got to make the bathroom look good. Got to make the class bathroom smell good. I'm going to decorate the table." She took care of Emanuel Church. She was an usher. She had a strut that we all looked for every first Sunday. She was a delightful, delightful woman. She took pride in everything.

We are going to miss all of them. We have already missed them, and we hope that God's work will still prevail. We are not in charge, but we just thank God that the judicial

1 system has worked. Thank you.

2 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Martin.

3 REVEREND MANNING: For the record, Eric Sheldon
4 Charles Manning.

5 THE COURT: Reverend, good to see you again.

6 REVEREND MANNING: Thank you. Likewise, Judge.

7 I have the wonderful opportunity of serving Mother
8 Emanuel as their current pastor. There is a familiar text
9 that I had shared with the members of Mother Emanuel since I
10 had arrived, from Psalm 27, Verse 1. It says, "The Lord is
11 my light and my salvation. Whom shall I fear? The Lord is
12 the stronghold of my life. Of whom shall I be afraid? When
13 evildoers came upon me to devour my flesh, my adversaries, my
14 foes, it is they who stumble and fall. And though an army
15 against me, my heart shall not fear. War rise against me,
16 yet I will be confident. One thing have I asked of the Lord
17 that I will seek after that I may dwell in the house of the
18 Lord all the days of my life and gaze upon the beauty of the
19 Lord and to dwell in his temple."

20 On June 17th, 2015, the temple of the house of God
21 was desecrated by what we have now come to know as a very
22 horrendous and heinous act. And for the past 19 -- almost
23 19 months, Mother Emanuel has gone through its struggles, its
24 challenges as we have tried our best to move forward. At
25 times we have made several mistakes. At times we have

1 questioned, but the resiliency and the strength of Mother
2 Emanuel continues to be a beacon of hope.

3 And when I was asked to come serve at Emanuel as
4 their pastor in June, I buckled at the sheer sense of
5 responsibility. Knowing the legacy of the Emanuel Nine,
6 knowing all of the people that I would not have an
7 opportunity to get to know -- yes, my paths had crossed with
8 Reverend Pinckney and very small glimpses with Reverend
9 Simmons, but I did not have the opportunity to get to know
10 them for whom they were.

11 And as we've begun the slow walk through the trials
12 and, of course, the guilt and the sentencing phase, my heart
13 has continued to grieve for the loss of these nine family
14 members, the survivors, what Sister Felicia had to endure,
15 what Sister Pauly had to endure, what Sister Jennifer had to
16 endure. But I as their pastor continue to seek God's ways
17 and ask Him for the strength for just the ministry of
18 presence. And even in the midst of everything that we have
19 heard, everything that we have seen, everything that we have
20 experienced, I am glad to say, I'm happy to report that hate
21 has not had the final word, that love still continues to
22 prevail, even in the midst of what took place there in the
23 first level of Mother Emanuel. Every Wednesday before the
24 first Sunday, we celebrate in our Bible study what we have --
25 what is referred to as "love feast." And as we are sharing

1 with the bread and the water, and we are going in the circle,
2 we are embracing each other and saying, "We love you in
3 Jesus's name."

4 And if we are quiet, we can hear the echos of the
5 Holy Spirit throughout that lower level because what Satan
6 may have meant for evil, God has meant it for good. And we
7 see that love. We see that resilience. We see the tenacity.
8 We see the drive. And even in the midst of that, I know that
9 we will not allow the enemy to steal our joy, our peace, our
10 hope. Whether you try, you will not be able to steal our
11 love nor be able to tear this family apart. I say "this
12 family" because now we have a commonality that draws us
13 together. Sister Sanders has already asked about being a
14 part of this family, and I'm sure she knows that she already
15 is. This family that had to endure the struggle, this family
16 that had to endure the pains, and this family I know beyond a
17 shadow of a doubt will grow stronger with each day that
18 passes because they know about the power of prayer, about the
19 power of faith, but also about the power of love and
20 forgiveness.

21 You see, hate will never ever be able to cast out
22 the light that Jesus has given to us. That light will
23 continue to shine. And these families will continue to grow,
24 to glow, and to know Christ in his fullness. Even as the
25 struggle of what we have had to endure, God still shouts in

1 my ear and even in my sleepless nights.

2 And for you, Dylann Roof, I would encourage you with
3 these words that I came across a year ago today -- you may
4 not look at me, but I believe and I know that you hear. It
5 said, "God finds value in you. The creator of the universe
6 wants you. Not for your mind, not for your body, your
7 clothes, your achievements, your intellect, your personality,
8 but because you are you." He would go any distance and pay
9 any price just to possess you. In fact, He did it, not just
10 for you, but for all of us when he gave us his only begotten
11 son, when Jesus came to earth from heaven and purchased you
12 with his blood. That's how much he wants you. That's how
13 valuable you are in his eyes. But that is how valuable those
14 nine that you had taken as well. But he still loves you.
15 And if you repent and seek his forgiveness, he will surely do
16 that for you.

17 I also received a communique as well, Judge, from
18 our presiding bishop, Samuel Lawrence Green, Sr. If I may be
19 able to read that.

20 THE COURT: Please do.

21 REVEREND MANNING: This is from Bishop Green. He
22 has been with us as well during the season of this trial. It
23 says that "The inhumane acts of Dylann Roof on June 17th,
24 2015 has caused immense damage to the families of the
25 victims, the survivors and their families, the Mother Emanuel

1 Church family and the Seventh Episcopal District and the AME
2 Church family. His intentional racist actions has impacted
3 who were and are the best church family that African
4 Methodism has to offer. But it also has changed how we do
5 church and how we operate going forward. He took a promising
6 pastor, upcoming clergy, retired minister who was a sage, and
7 devoted, dedicated, and committed members of our African
8 Methodist Episcopal Church family.

9 "Whereas his actions were and are horrific and,
10 indeed, make and push his racist platform of hate, division,
11 and ugliness of humanity, the families' and survivors'
12 response of love and perseverance, unity, strength, became
13 the platform that spoke louder than the voice of bigotry that
14 Dylann Roof attempted to espouse.

15 "I thank God for the Court who had to wrestle with
16 the hard evidence and apply the available and applicable law
17 to render the decision of guilt and sentence for these
18 heinous crimes. I don't take what you have gone through
19 lightly. I praise God for these families and survivors who
20 had to relive the horrible June 17th, 2015, night over with
21 video and photos of their loved ones and to be forever
22 reminded daily of the treasures they lost for the rest of
23 their lives. To this Court and to the world listening, the
24 real story is that these families and all of us who were
25 affected directly or indirectly by Mr. Roof, your

1 sentence" -- "your senseless actions didn't work. Racism
2 will not prevail. Hatred will not reign, not when this world
3 possesses people like these families in this courtroom and
4 the Mother Emanuel Church family, and the African Methodist
5 Episcopal Church family, and across the life and breadth of
6 this world living out our full lives in love. Thank you."

7 THE COURT: Please extend my appreciation for those
8 words.

9 REVEREND MANNING: I will do so. Thank you.

10 THE COURT: Thank you.

11 MR. WILLIAMS: We don't have any more witnesses,
12 Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: You have no more witnesses? Okay. I'll
14 be glad -- Mr. Bruck, does the defendant wish to be heard?

15 MR. BRUCK: Nothing from counsel and nothing from
16 the defendant.

17 THE COURT: I'm sorry?

18 MR. BRUCK: Nothing from the defendant.

19 THE COURT: Do you wish to be heard?

20 MR. BRUCK: No, sir.

21 THE COURT: Does anyone wish to speak on behalf of
22 the defendant?

23 MR. BRUCK: No, Your Honor.

24 THE COURT: Very good.

25 This trial has produced no winners, only losers.

1 The families have lost their beloved and irreplaceable loved
2 ones, and the defendant will now pay for his crimes with his
3 life. But the trial has not been a futile act because the
4 jury, acting as the conscience of this community, has stated
5 clearly and unequivocally that this hate, this viciousness,
6 this moral depravity will not go unanswered.

7 This proceeding cannot give the families what they
8 truly want, the return of their loved ones, but it can give
9 them and this community a measure of justice. Dr. King
10 stated that, "The arm of the moral universe is long, but it
11 bends towards justice." And so justice will be done.

12 Mr. Roof, please stand while I impose your sentence.

13 Count 1, hate crime act resulting in the death of
14 Sharonda Coleman-Singleton, maximum sentence up to life. I
15 sentence the defendant under Count 1 to life.

16 Count 2, hate crime act resulting in the death of
17 Cynthia Hurd, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence the
18 defendant under Count 2 to life.

19 Count 3, hate crime act resulting in the death of
20 Susie Jackson, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence the
21 defendant under Count 3 to life.

22 Count 4, hate crime act resulting in the death of
23 Ethel Lee Lance, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence the
24 defendant under Count 4 to life.

25 Count 5, hate crime act resulting in the death of

1 DePayne Middleton Doctor, maximum sentence up to life. I
2 sentence the defendant under Count 5 to life.

3 Count 6, hate crime act resulting in the death of
4 Reverend Clementa Pinckney, maximum sentence up to life. I
5 sentence the defendant under Count 6 to life.

6 Count 7, hate crime act resulting in the death of
7 Tywanza Sanders, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence the
8 defendant under Count 7 to life.

9 Count 8, hate crime act resulting in the death of
10 Reverend Daniel Simmons Sr., imprisonment for -- maximum
11 sentence up to life. I sentence the defendant under Count 8
12 to life.

13 Count 9, hate crime act resulting in the death of
14 Myra Thompson, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence the
15 defendant under Count 9 to life.

16 Count 10, hate crime act involving intent to kill
17 KM, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence the defendant
18 under Count 10 to life.

19 Count 11, hate crime act involving intent to kill
20 Felicia Sanders, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence the
21 defendant under Count 11 to life.

22 Count 12, hate crime act involving an attempt to
23 kill Polly Sheppard, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence
24 the defendant under Count 12 to life.

25 Count 13, obstruction of the exercise of religion

1 resulting in the death of Reverend Sharonda
2 Coleman-Singleton, a sentence of death is mandated by the
3 jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence
4 the defendant under Count 13 to death.

5 Count 14, obstruction of the exercise of religion
6 resulting in the death of Cynthia Hurd, a sentence of death
7 is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's
8 verdict, I sentence the defendant under count 14 to death.

9 Count 15, obstruction of the exercise of religion
10 resulting in the death of Susie Jackson, a sentence of death
11 is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's
12 verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 15 to death.

13 Count 16, obstruction of the exercise of religion
14 resulting in the death of Ethel Lee Lance, a sentence of
15 death is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the
16 jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 16 to
17 death.

18 Count 17, obstruction of the exercise of religion
19 resulting in the death of Reverend DePayne Middleton Doctor,
20 a sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict.
21 Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant
22 under Count 17 to death.

23 Count 18, obstruction of the exercise of religion
24 resulting in the death of Reverend Clementa Pinckney, a
25 sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict.

1 Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant
2 under Count 18 to death.

3 Count 19, obstruction of the exercise of religion
4 resulting in the death of Tywanza Sanders, a sentence of
5 death is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the
6 jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 19 to
7 death.

8 Count 20, obstruction of the exercise of religion
9 resulting in the death of Reverend Daniel Simmons Sr., a
10 sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict.

11 Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant
12 under Count 20 to death.

13 Count 21, obstruction of the exercise of religion
14 resulting in the death of Myra Thompson, a sentence of death
15 is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's
16 verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 21 to death.

17 Count 22, obstruction of the exercise of religion
18 involving an intent to kill KM and the use of a dangerous
19 weapon, maximum sentence up to life. I sentence the
20 defendant under Count 22 to life.

21 Count 23, obstruction of the exercise of religion
22 involving an intent to kill Felicia Sanders, maximum sentence
23 up to life. I sentence the defendant under Count 23 to life.

24 Count 24, obstruction of the exercise of religion
25 involving an intent to kill Polly Sheppard, maximum sentence

1 up to life. I sentence the defendant under Count 24 to life.

2 Count 25, use of a firearm to commit the murder of
3 Reverend Sharonda Coleman-Singleton during and in relation to
4 a crime of violence, a sentence of death is mandated by the
5 jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence
6 the defendant under Count 25 to death.

7 Count 26, use of a firearm to commit the murder of
8 Cynthia Hurd during and in relation to a crime of violence, a
9 sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict.
10 Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant
11 under Count 26 to death.

12 Count 27, use of a firearm to commit the murder of
13 Susie Jackson during and in relation to a crime of violence,
14 a sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict.
15 Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant
16 under Count 27 to death.

17 Count 28, use of a firearm to commit the murder of
18 Ethel Lee Lance during and in relation to a crime of
19 violence, a sentence of death is mandated by the jury's
20 verdict. Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the
21 defendant under Count 28 to death.

22 Count 29, use of a firearm to commit the murder of
23 Reverend DePayne Middleton Doctor, a sentence of death is
24 mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's
25 verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 29 to death.

Count 30, use of a firearm to commit the murder of Reverend Clementa Pinckney, a sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 30 to death.

Count 31, use of a firearm to commit the murder of Tywanza Sanders, a sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 31 to death.

Count 32, use of a firearm to commit the murder of Reverend Daniel Simmons Sr., a sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 32 to death.

Count 33, use of a firearm to commit the murder of Myra Thompson, a sentence of death is mandated by the jury's verdict. Pursuant to the jury's verdict, I sentence the defendant under Count 33 to death.

Okay. You may take a seat, Mr. Roof, and counsel.

Let me now address several matters that have come to my attention. Mr. Roof, you had asked for representation of counsel for post-trial motions. Is that correct, sir?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: And I asked -- you mentioned yesterday that you would like me -- and that's correct, you want counsel? You desire to have counsel representing you in regard to the post-trial motions; is that correct, sir?

1 THE DEFENDANT: That's correct.

2 THE COURT: Okay. Now, I mentioned to you
3 yesterday, you said you wanted to not have your standby
4 counsel serve as your post-trial counsel, and I asked you to
5 prepare some comments to me, information about why you felt
6 that I should replace them. And I'm glad to hear from you.

7 THE DEFENDANT: I just don't trust them.

8 THE COURT: Anything else?

THE DEFENDANT: No. That's all.

10 THE COURT: Well, you are not the first defendant to
11 ask me to replace their court-appointed counsel, and I dare
12 say you will not be the last. And among the factors that I
13 need to look into is to explore the reasons for the
14 representation and whether that would interfere with their
15 effectiveness. The important purpose here is for you to have
16 effective assistance of counsel. And the fact that you may
17 have disagreements with them or you may not trust them is,
18 standing alone, not sufficient.

19 I have observed them. One of the factors is are
20 they in fact effective? Are they in fact competent? Are
21 they in fact loyal? And they are. They have zealously
22 represented you, sometimes trying my patience, Mr. Roof, from
23 time to time, but never for any purpose other than to advance
24 your cause. And I see no basis from what you have shared
25 with me that they should not or would not be a proper counsel

1 for you in the post-trial motions. I feel it would be a
2 great loss of resources and talent. This team has worked
3 diligently. They know this record inside and out, and I deny
4 your motion to replace them. And I hereby appoint Mr. Bruck
5 and his team to represent the defendant in post-trial
6 motions. The motion to substitute counsel is denied.

7 Now, I was asked also about to provide an extension
8 of some additional time beyond the 14 days, the statute the
9 rule provides, and Mr. Bruck, talk to me about that.

10 MR. BRUCK: Well, it is customary in cases of this
11 nature for the Court to grant an extension of time in order
12 to gather the research grounds for a motion for new trial.

13 THE COURT: Well, now, let me just say this,
14 Mr. Bruck, that for inexperienced and unskilled counsel who
15 have not filed motions every -- frankly every couple of days,
16 you have been incredibly diligent about every presumed error
17 in this thing. You have had realtime transcripts and a team
18 of I don't know how many attorneys actually helping you. I'm
19 going to give you more than 14 days, but you know, I -- I
20 have a great deal of confidence in your team and your
21 capacity to get the work done, and we need to move this
22 process along.

23 I'm doing to give you 30 days to file, and I'm going
24 to give the Government 15 days to respond to the motion and
25 five days for reply.

1 MR. BRUCK: Would that be 30 days from the
2 expiration of the statute?

3 THE COURT: No, 30 days from today.

4 MR. BRUCK: Very well.

5 THE COURT: I have every confidence that you and
6 your team can comply with that.

7 MR. BRUCK: Very well.

8 THE COURT: Mr. Richardson, let me address a matter
9 to you, sir. Under 18, United States Code, 3596(a), a
10 defendant convicted in a capital case involving a federal
11 conviction, the custody is remanded to the Attorney General.
12 Are you aware of that, sir?

13 MR. RICHARDSON: I am, Your Honor.

14 THE COURT: Tell me what that as a practical matter
15 means.

16 MR. RICHARDSON: As a practical matter, at this
17 particular moment -- and I'll tell you that the Government is
18 well aware of these issues, and it's in the process of
19 working to resolve them. But for this point in time, I think
20 that is what the Court does. That is the order that is
21 issued. I brought an example of a judgment in one of these
22 cases that I will provide to the Court as an example of what
23 has been done, if I can hand this to Ms. Eunice, as far as
24 the language goes.

25 THE COURT: Mr. Richardson, you always seem

2 MR. RICHARDSON: Your Honor, it would not be fair to
3 say that it's my anticipation, but my colleagues -- I just
4 get to stand up and repeat it.

5 Your Honor, in this particular scenario, the Court
6 is well aware that the defendant is currently here pursuant
7 to a writ.

10 MR. RICHARDSON: As a result, he currently continues
11 to be on that writ up until the time that that situation
12 changes. The Court's order may not be fully carried out, but
13 we anticipate that that is an issue that the Government, in
14 cooperation with an array of folks, are working on.

19 MR. RICHARDSON: That's correct.

20 THE COURT: So his immediate residence would likely
21 not change, correct?

22 MR. RICHARDSON: That is absolutely correct, Your
23 Honor.

1 allow them to try him if they wish to do that, correct?

2 MR. RICHARDSON: That is correct, Your Honor.

3 THE COURT: I think that is -- as a practical
4 matter, it's not a big deal.

5 MR. RICHARDSON: It is not, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: And in the same way the State issued a
7 writ, you know, I would issue a writ to the State.

8 MR. RICHARDSON: Absolutely, Your Honor. This is --
9 while there may be a few technical steps, this is a technical
10 process that is not a substantive issue that we anticipate
11 becoming any sort of a problem.

12 THE COURT: Very good. Okay.

13 Mr. Roof, let me provide you a notice of your appeal
14 rights, sir, if I might. You have a right, a constitutional
15 right to appeal. You have 14 days from the entry of judgment
16 or an order being appealed to file your notice of appeal.
17 Your attorneys will be filing motions, so it will be 14 days
18 after the filing of the Court's decision responding to the
19 motion.

20 Am I correct, Mr. Bruck, on that?

21 MR. BRUCK: Yes, Your Honor.

22 THE COURT: Very good. So the deadline is tolled
23 during this period. You have a right to file an appeal in
24 forma pauperis, and the Clerk of Court will prepare and file
25 a notice of appeal upon your request. All you have to do if

1 you are -- I'm sure your counsel will do that for you, but in
2 the event you would like the clerk to do it, if you would
3 notify me, Ms. Ravenel will file it on your behalf. Okay?

4 THE DEFENDANT: Okay.

5 THE COURT: Are there any other matters to come
6 before the Court? From the Government?

7 MR. RICHARDSON: Nothing, Your Honor. Thank you.

8 THE COURT: From the defense?

9 MR. BRUCK: No.

10 THE COURT: Thank you very much. The hearing is
11 adjourned. I'm going to step back in the jury room.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4 I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript
5 from the record of proceedings in the above-titled matter.

6

7

8

9

Amy C. Diaz, RPR, CRR

February 13, 2017

10

11

/S Amy Diaz

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25